Reviewer's report

Title: Resolving authorship disputes by mediation and arbitration

Version: 1 Date: 06 Sep 2018

Reviewer: Ana Marusic

Reviewer's report:

The revised manuscript has addressed most of the reviewers' comments and reads well. The authors has emphasized the limitations of the proposal for authorship mediation. However, there is still no attempt to actually address all relevant problems related to establishing an arbitration body (either as a separate entity or within the existing structures, such as journals). For example, who would fund the arbitration process if a commercial body would perform it. Would funding agencies accept such costs - wouldn't they expect that the authorship problem is resolved on time (before submitting a manuscript) and in the research group? It seems to me that what is still missing is describing procedures for assessing and deciding on authorship during the research process, to prevent authorship disputes - such procedures and experiences have been published and may be useful for discussing the strategies to prevent arbitration about authorship.

Level of interest
Please indicate how interesting you found the manuscript:

An article of limited interest

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

'I declare that I have no competing interests.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal.