Reviewer’s report

Title: Open to the Public: Paywalls and the Public Rationale for Open Access Medical Research Publishing

Version: 1 Date: 18 Nov 2019

Reviewer: Steven Walker

Reviewer's report:

This is a useful and timely article which makes a well-argued case for universal open access publishing.

I have no criticisms and nothing of substance to add.

It is well written.

Research involvement and engagement is an appropriate vehicle for this manuscript.

I particularly like your 'promise', figures provided (e.g. 2017 revenue) and the examples e.g. LGBT in China and rejection of a contract with Elsevier by the University of California.

Addressing the criticisms of open access is an important section.

The initial reviewer comments have been appropriately responded to

It is well-referenced.

Level of interest
Please indicate how interesting you found the manuscript:

An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal