Author’s response to reviews

Title: Meat consumption providing a surplus energy in modern diet contributes to obesity prevalence: an ecological analysis

Authors:

Wenpeng You (wenpeng.you@adelaide.edu.au)

Maciej Henneberg (maciej.henneberg@adelaide.edu.au)

Version: 4 Date: 03 Mar 2016

Author’s response to reviews:

I simply pasted what I just emailed to you just now as the response to the editor's comments. Thank you again.

-----Original Message-----

From: em.nutn.0.4a2c9e.1060ec3c@editorialmanager.com [mailto:em.nutn.0.4a2c9e.1060ec3c@editorialmanager.com] On Behalf Of BMC Nutrition Editorial Office

Sent: Wednesday, March 30, 2016 6:06 PM

To: Wenpeng You <wenpeng.you@adelaide.edu.au>

Subject: Your submission to BMC Nutrition - NUTN-D-15-00073R3

NUTN-D-15-00073R3

Meat consumption providing a surplus energy in modern diet contributes to obesity prevalence: an ecological analysis Wenpeng You; Maciej Henneberg BMC Nutrition

Dear Mr. You,

Thank you for submitting the revised version of your manuscript "Meat consumption providing a surplus energy in modern diet contributes to obesity prevalence: an ecological analysis" (NUTN-D-15-00073R3) and for making the changes requested.

Please accept my apologies for the delay in contacting you, but I needed to check with senior colleagues regarding your statement about data availability. Following discussions, we would be grateful if you could provide a more detailed explanation of how the data used in the study were obtained.

Authors: Thanks for your time for the discussion.
More detailed explanation of how the data used in the study were obtained has been included in the section of “Declaration”. This point-by-point response will be uploaded as the cover letter when I re-submit the manuscript and the supporting documents.

For example, although you mention that the data are freely available, did you approach the holders of the data in order to obtain permission for its use, or is it publicly available for use without prior permission. Please could you clarify exactly how the data were obtained, whether permission was required or if it is publicly available to use without permission. Please add this information to the data availability subsection.

Authors: We checked the terms and conditions at the data holders’ websites regarding how to use their published data when we started this study. Following your email, we consulted the respective data holder to make sure that our understanding on use their data is correct. Now the data availability subsection has been amended:

Availability of data and materials

All data for this study are publicly available and are ready for the public to download at no cost from the official websites of the World Bank, the WHO and FAO. Use of these data for this private research falls within these UN agency’s public permission in their terms and conditions. There is no need to have the formal permission to use the data for this study.

The sources and data robustness have been described in the section of “Methods”. Furthermore, all the data supporting our findings are contained within the Supplemental File titled, Table S2 Detailed information of country-level estimates.

Additionally, following the data holder’s suggestions, we added the references to specify the data availability even though we already described it in the manuscript text. The two new references are:


We just need to be sure that the data is not copyrighted and can be used used without formal permission.

Authors: All the data used in this study is copyrighted, but was published officially by the respective holders. The use of the data falls within the holders’ public permission as per the respective organization’s terms and conditions.

Once you have made the necessary corrections, please submit a revised manuscript online at:
Authors: I will upload the revised manuscript as instructed here.

If you have forgotten your username or password please use the "Send Login Details" link to get your login information. For security reasons, your password will be reset.

Please include a cover letter with a point-by-point response to the comments.

A decision will be made once we have received your revised manuscript, which we expect by 13 Apr 2016.

We look forward to receiving your revised manuscript soon.

Best wishes,

James Mockridge

BMC Nutrition

http://www.biomedcentral.com/bmcnutr