Reviewer's report

Title: Adherence to daily dietary and activity goals set within a Māori and Pacific weight loss competition

Version: 0 Date: 04 Sep 2018

Reviewer: Michael G Perri

Reviewer's report:

This paper has several important strengths and a number of key limitations. The study's strengths involve (a) the high prevalence and clinical significance of the problem of obesity among New Zealand Pacific and Maori populations and (b) the development of a culturally relevant behavioral intervention to improve adherence to daily dietary and physical activity goals via group competitions. The major limitation of the project, as acknowledged by the authors, involves an extremely high rate of attrition. Only 5 of 19 teams of participants "persisted to 24 weeks." As a consequence, it is difficult to conduct any meaningful quantitative analyses of the strategies designed to improve adherence. Therefore, it would be more reasonable to revise the manuscript and present the study as a description of "lessons learned" rather than as an "evaluation" of a weight-loss competition.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

No

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

No

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

No

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics
Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal.