Reviewer's report

Title: Using the RE-AIM Framework to Evaluate a Community-Based Summer Camp for Children with Obesity: A Prospective Feasibility Study

Version: 2 Date: 2 December 2014

Reviewer: Barry A Garst

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. On page 6, line 146 the authors note that the intervention was implemented as part of a camp (day camp) from 9 am to 4 pm. Why was this approach chosen? There is a substantial body of research that supports how camps can be effective settings for knowledge, behavior, skill and/or attitude change, but the authors do not cite that literature. I would expect this point to be addressed not only the Background section but also in the Discussion section as reflection on the camp experience as contributing (or not) to the program effectiveness. In general it’s not clear how the camp setting was important for the study. On page 7, line 167, it’s noted that participants attended “some camp sessions.” What was the content of these sessions and was it important?

2. On page 16, lines 379-389, improvements in emotional QOL as a result of CHAMP are emphasized. To what program elements is this change attributed? Although a significant literature points to the influence of camp experiences on peer relationships, friendship-making, and social-emotional skills in general, the authors do not recognize the potential impact of the camp experience (or the program as embedded within a summer camp model).

3. Throughout the manuscript the authors define treatment fidelity as “an estimate of knowledge retained” yet a citation is not provided for this definition of fidelity. Because fidelity is an important concept in program implementation science, the authors need to better support their definition and perhaps recognize how their definition may differ from other conceptualizations of fidelity.

4. On page 18 in lines 416-421 the authors discuss the influence of parental attendance on program effectiveness, but more needs to be said about parental involvement. Were there any program elements that tended to resonate with parents and encourage parent involvement? Are changes needed within the existing program to enhance parental involvement? What can program providers learn from this study that can inform their efforts to engage parents in childhood obesity programs?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.