Reviewer's report

Title: Plasma branched-chain and aromatic amino acid concentration after ingestion of an urban or rural diet in rural Mexican women.

Version: 1 Date: 14 July 2014

Reviewer: Folke Hammarqvist

Reviewer's report:

In the present study the effect on plasma amino acid pattern following ingestion of either an urban or rural diet is presented. The study involves 15 subjects in a cross-over design. The authors show differences with a more pronounced increase of postprandial BCAA, tyrosine and proline concentrations after ingestion of an urban more protein- and fat-containing diet. This finding is of interest and may have implications for health and possibly for development of illnessess related to metabolic conditions such as obesity, metabolic syndrome and diabetes.

Minor essential revisions

It could be of value to include a classical reference by Elia et al. Effects of ingested steak and infused leucine on forelimb metabolism in man and the fate of the carbon skeletons and amino groups of branched-chain amino acids. Clin Sci, 64; 517-526, 1983.

A suggestion is to increase the bars and the p-value incorporated in the figures to make it easier to read.

It would be of interest if glucose and insulin values have been collected during the same time-frame as the amino acids in order to cover the different nutrients effect on insulin release and glucose level. If so, it is a good idea to present them.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests