Reviewer’s report

Title: Plasma branched-chain and aromatic amino acid concentration after ingestion of an urban or rural diet in rural Mexican women.

Version: 1 Date: 11 July 2014

Reviewer: Ken F Blemings

Reviewer’s report:

The manuscript of Lopez et al. (BMC- Obesity- Plasma branched-chain and aromatic amino acid concentration after ingestion of an urban or rural diet in rural Mexican women) provides data on amino acid concentrations after ingestion of two different meal types in rural Mexican women. The background for the information is the rise in obesity after rural people move to urban settings and the insulin resistance associated with obesity. The study is reasonably well done although, there are some issues that would need to be addressed before publication could be considered.

Major concerns

Was there an internal or external standard for the amino acid analysis?

Did each woman serve as her own control or were the results averaged over all women? It appears that the data are pooled across diet and this should be stated.

The fact that the women were from a rural population is interesting although one would have expected the same result if the women were from a urban background, correct? The differences are likely just a function of the diet consumed, not where the subjects were from.

Discretionary Revisions

L129 – consider putting P-values in for each amino acid since some are significant and some are not.

L162 - ....to proteins at a higher rate

L169 ...such as norepinephrine which is known to modify food intake.

Intriguingly, we also....

L172 ....the greater increase

L175 ..in feeding behavior affect rural populations.

L177 ...companies that increase access to energy dense foods.

L178 ..is reflected in the greater increase in the prevalence of overweight and obesity in rural (3.9%) compared to urban (2.5%) women in the last 6 years.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'