Reviewer’s report

Title: Sema3A Drastically Suppresses Tumor Growth in Oral Cancer Xenograft Model of Mice

Version: 0 Date: 13 Jan 2017

Reviewer: Guido Serini

Reviewer's report:

In their manuscript authors investigate the effects of lentivirus-mediated Sema3A overexpression in the human tongue cell carcinoma cell line SCC9. As conceivable, based on a wide body of literature (for review see Neufeld et al., Cold Spring Harb. Perspect. Med., 2012, 2:a006718 doi: 10.1101/cshperspect.a006718; Worzfeld & Offermans, Nat. Rev. Cancer, 2014, 13:603-621) authors observed that Sema3A inhibits: i) endothelial tube formation on matrigel; ii) in vivo angiogenesis in the chicken chorioallantoic membrane and in subcutaneous SCC9 xenograft in mice; iii) growth of SCC9 xenografts in mice; iv) VEGF signaling. This is a largely confirmatory manuscript that does not add any new knowledge to the field of semaphorins in angiogenesis and cancer. The general quality of data is poor; for example the quality of pictures documenting in Figure 3 the results of in vitro tube formation and chicken chorioallantoic membrane assays are out of focus and extremely difficult to evaluate. Also the quality of the immunohistochemical stainings of figure 4E of low quality.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics
Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal