Reviewer’s report

Title: Sema3A Drastically Suppresses Tumor Growth in Oral Cancer Xenograft Model of Mice

Version: 0 Date: 09 Dec 2016

Reviewer: Anurag Singh

Reviewer's report:

This paper by Huang et al. describes the anti-angiogenic and anti-tumor suppressive properties of SEMA3A in oral squamous cell cancer cells (SCC-9 cell line). The studies are well conducted overall. Although some studies have shown anti-angiogenic effects of SEM3A, this is the first to show these effects in the context of oral cancer. Some concerns are listed below:

1. In the Methods section, the vector system used for lentiviral production should be stated, i.e. what are the gag/pol and env encoding vectors? Second or third generation system?

2. The resolution of some plots and images in the Figures are very poor. Higher resolution images should be used. Also, Fig. 3B appears out of focus.

3. Statistical Student t-tests should be performed to confirm significance of pairwise comparisons of vector control versus SEMA3A expressing cells.

4. It is not clear whether the tumor suppressive effects of SEMA3A are cell autonomous or non-cell autonomous or a combination. SEMA3A blocks VEGFR2 activity in tumor cells, so could have an anti-proliferative effect in addition to the effects on endothelial cells. These alternatives should be discussed in more detail.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?  
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?  
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?  
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes
Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

None.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal