Reviewer's report

Title: Association Between Body Mass Index and Suicidal Behaviors: A Systematic Review Protocol

Version: 2 Date: 11 March 2015

Reviewer: Porjai Pattanittum

Reviewer's report:

Thank you for revising your manuscript.

According to the revised manuscript, please consider the following points:

1) Line 262, page 12, you plan to apply a random-effects model if I-squared > 40%, so there are 2 options available (fixed, random-effects model). Therefore, words in line 236 (page 10) “…summary estimate using a random effects model as a certain degree of heterogeneity in…” need a modification for this issue. (Except, you plan to use a conservative method (a random-effects model) to any meta-analysis if so, please modify, if so a modification of line 262 is needed).

2) Line 265-266, “Three separate meta-analyses will be conducted to investigate the association between BMI and completed suicide, BMI and attempted suicide, and BMI and suicidal ideation.” Line 267-268, “The aforementioned suicidal behaviors differ with respects to etiology, population, and prevalence, and therefore they will be treated as separateoutcomes [60].”

(Refer to Line 265-266): As you are going to explore the relationship between BMI (exposure) and suicidal behaviors, normally we perform a meta-analysis for each outcome and I agreed. But I am just confused about information in line 267-268. Would it be ok to remove line 265-266? If not, please kindly explain to me.

3) Line 276-295, those are about the qualitative synthesis? If so, please move line 272-275, “Review Manager 5.3 (The Cochrane Collaboration, London, UK) will be used for all statistical and pooled analyses. The results of the pooled analysis will be summarized by calculating odds ratios [ORs] or hazard ratios [HRs] and 95% confidence intervals.”, after line 268 or line 295.

4) Line 269, Presenting and reporting of results. It would be benefit to your protocol to consider a guideline for reporting meta-analysis in observational studies, e.g. MOOSE (Meta-analysis of observational studies in epidemiology: a proposal for reporting. Meta-analysis Of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (MOOSE) group).