Reviewer’s report

Title: A comparison of various types and thicknesses of adhesive felt padding materials in the reduction of peak plantar pressure of the foot. A case study.

Version: 8 Date: 27 July 2015

Reviewer: Aoife Healy

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Do you believe the case report is authentic?:

Yes

Do you have any ethical concerns?:

No

Is the Abstract representative of the case presented?:

Yes

Does the Introduction explain the relevance of the case to the medical literature?:

Yes

Does the article report relevant patient information?: Yes

Does the article report relevant physical examination findings?: Yes

Does the article report important dates and times in this case?: Yes

Does the article report the diagnostic assessments?: Yes

Does the article report the types of intervention?: Yes

Does the article report a summary of the clinical course of all follow-up visits?: Yes

If any information is missing from the reporting, please detail it here.:

More detailed analysis of the plantar pressure data

Is the interpretation (discussion and conclusion) well balanced and
supported by the case presented?:

No, not until further analysis is completed

Does the case represent a useful contribution to the medical literature?:

Yes

Was written informed consent to publish this case obtained?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?:

Yes

Additional comments to authors?:

The example additional analysis provided does not isolate the regions of interest independently and I still consider this necessary in order to determine the effectiveness of the padding in offloading. I think you need to consider using the polygon feature in FScan to cover the area of the cut out and the periphery. I have attached a sample image of an FScan trial showing how you could draw a polygon to match the exact size of the cut out (Green polygon) and also draw a polygon around the periphery of the cut out (Red polygon). These polygons can then be saved as an object file and loaded onto the subsequent trials to ensure they are always placed in the same location. Your analysis should examine the peak pressures of both polygons, the area of the cut out and the periphery.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests