Reviewer's report

Title: Surgical Clipping of A1 Dissecting Cerebral Aneurysms.

Version: 2 Date: 10 April 2015

Reviewer: Atul Goel

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors present a single case of a right A1 dissecting aneurysm which was treated by them by clipping of the right A1 artery. The right A1 artery was hypoplastic and both the A2 vessels were seen to be filling from the left side. What was the exact pre-operative neurological status of the patient? How much left sided weakness was present postoperatively and at delayed follow up? The follow up period is rather short.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published
Declaration of competing interests:

Nil