Reviewer’s report

Title: Spontaneous thoracic ventral spinal subdural hematoma mimicking a tumoral lesion: a case report

Version: 3 Date: 15 December 2014

Reviewer: Nicolas Useche

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: Yes

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The case is interesting because is an unusual pathology with unusual etiology. The most interesting part of the report are the imaging findings. In the preoperative images it looks like an extramedullary intradural lesion, like an arachnoid cyst or tumoral lesion with proteinaceous or bloody fluid in it, however the surgical appearance is clearly subdural. When comparison of your imaging findings is done with the images in your references and literature, usually the subdural lesions are convex and crescentic in appearance and tend to be around the cord with delineation of the dural sac with intact epidural fat. Up and down extension is frequent, even extension to the posterior cranial fossa may be present, however your lesion is focal and it looks independent from the dura. The emphasis on early surgical management is very important, but this is already
reported.
I think you should focus on the unusual imaging appearance of this subdural lesion to contribute with something new to the literature.

Sincerely,

Juan Nicolas Useche

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests.