Reviewer's report

Title: Aspiration pneumonia/bronchopneumonia successfully prevented by qing fei tang in two Japanese patients with progressive supranuclear palsy: a case series

Version: 2
Date: 10 January 2015
Reviewer: Christian Koch

Which of the following following best describes what type of case report this is?: An unexpected event in the course of observing or treating a patient

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes
Is the case report authentic?: Yes
Is the case report ethical?: Yes
Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No
Is this case worth reporting?: Yes
Is the case report persuasive?: Yes
Does the case report have explanatory value?: No
Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No
Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes
Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

The authors present a well written case series on 2 Japanese patients, both elderly men, suffering from supranuclear palsy and recurrent aspiration pneumonia and experiencing less episodes of pneumonia after the intake of qing fei tang. The CARE checklist has been checked and followed. At the end of their discussion, the authors provide some mechanistic insights about these observations. Figures 1 and 2 are helpful for illustrating the time course.

Suggestions:
1. page 2, abstract before patient 2: say "administration of qing fei tang
2. page 4, introduction: please define / name the 16 herb ingredients of qing fei tang which is a mixture
3. page 5, patient 2: check the spelling of carbocisteine / carbocysteine, also in figure 2

4. page 6, middle: say "afterwards" ....for a relatively

5. page 7, top: consider rephrasing this sentence - "Further large-scale, ideally mechanistic, studies may better clarify whether ....." Otherwise, large scale association studies will likely follow the mathematical law of statistics showing a "significant p value truth" which in the end will most often turn out to be only "pseudotruth".

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'