Reviewer's report

Title: Intraosseous lipoma of the third lumbar spine: a case report

Version: 3

Date: 17 October 2014

Reviewer: KANJI SASAKI

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: Unexpected or unusual presentations of a disease

Has the case been reported coherently?: Yes

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: No

Is this case worth reporting?: Yes

Is the case report persuasive?: Yes

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: Yes

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: Yes

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

I read this report with interest and to show this rare disease is important. However I suggest some minor revise or comments to be better.

1. to describe the height, weight of this man, despite lipoma is not tend to occur for the popularity with obese.
2. Gd>>>abbreviation
3. Page 6, line 1
   Intraoperative pathological......diagnosed.
   it is better to change this sentence after "The tumorous.....replaced." because the diagnosis is usually after surgery.
4. numbering of reference is not easy to read.
Renumbering is better.

Comments

1. Discussion page 7 line 5
Is this quite rare? Probably, the disease that 14 cases reported is rare but not quite. However to remove and diagnose the lipoma at spinous process is very rare.

2. Usually lipoma is not the cause of pain, why is this tumor caused pain? please add your opinion.

3. page 8 line 2-3 why did you describe? I think this sentence about HA is not needed, because this is not your main opinion.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'