Reviewer’s report

Title: Local advanced skin flap to restore nearly half of lower lip: a case report

Version: 4 Date: 7 October 2014

Reviewer: ovunc akdemir

Which of the following best describes what type of case report this is?: None

Has the case been reported coherently?: No

Is the case report authentic?: Yes

Is the case report ethical?: Yes

Is there any missing information that you think must be added before publication?: Yes

Is this case worth reporting?: No

Is the case report persuasive?: No

Does the case report have explanatory value?: No

Does the case report have diagnostic value?: No

Will the case report make a difference to clinical practice?: No

Is the anonymity of the patient protected?: Yes

Comments to authors:

I read and researched this case report. This case related about "Local advanced skin flap to restore nearly half of lower lip: a case report." The authors referred a 13-year-old Mongolian female patient with giant congenital lower lip nevus. According to their measurement, the lesion covered nearly half of the lower lip. They designed a lower lip bilateral advanced skin flaps and an abbe flap to restore the wound surface after completely removing the nevus without advanced repair. In their conclusion, this case report demonstrates a case of more than 40% lower lip length defect repairing by direct closure without dysfunction. It was a beneficial attempt that minimized the scar and dysfunction.

I rejected this study because of:

1) First of all, bilateral advanced skin flaps or mucosal flaps are not new
technique for lip reconstruction.

2) I did not understand that what is the meaning of approximately 3 cm? The author has to give real size of their defect. According to their photos, the defect size is less than 40% lower lip length. It means, the primer close is enough for repairing this kind of defect, they did not need to make advanced flaps. The other big issue, the author mentioned about abbe flap, I did not see any abbe flap scar in their photos. Are the authors sure that they performed abbe flap?

3) The discussion part of this case report is too short. Bilateral extended Karapandzic flaps is one of the technique to repair big defects. However, there are alot of new and old techniques for using lip reconstruction. Even, they did not mention about traditional techniques. ( bernard,nakajima,,estlander,gillies fan flap,etc)

4) In my opinion, this article does not give enough new clinical information.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'