Reviewer’s report

Title: A biplot correlation range for group-wise metabolite selection in mass spectrometry

Version: 1 Date: 08 Nov 2018

Reviewer: Robert Flight

Reviewer's report:

Manuscript Number: BIDM-D-18-00020-R1

Full Title: A biplot correlation range for group-wise metabolite selection in mass spectrometry

Reviewer Name: Robert M Flight

### Summary Statement

I appreciate the work that the authors have put in to this revision to address the reviewer comments. The manuscript is significantly improved, and almost all of my concerns have been addressed.

Some minor points follow below.

### Availability of code

I am very glad to see that the authors have put the code and data on GitHub at https://github.com/kongktw/BCR, however I am still concerned.

1. The "Availability of data and materials" was not changed in the manuscript.

2. While GitHub is a wonderful resource for collaborating on code, **it is not a repository** for the purposes of publication, as the account owner can delete the repo at any time. I again recommend that the authors deposit the code and data to Figshare (https://figshare.com/), Zenodo (https://zenodo.org/) or Data Dryad (https://datadryad.org/), and reference both the GitHub and the data repository in this section.

3. There does not appear to be an easily identifiable README file explaining what the code is and what it does, and how to run it to generate the various results in the publication.

4. The code does not have an appropriate license, so anyone else who uses it does not know the conditions for re-use. I recommend the authors examine https://choosealicense.com/ and add an appropriate LICENSE file to the repo.
## Wording

Pg 18, line 21: "which reasonable in that the methods are able to identify strong single variables", should be "which is reasonable in that the methods are able to identify strong single variables"

Pg 18, line 39: "This results imply that the BCR method tends to", should be "This result implies that the BCR method tends to", or "These results imply that the BCR method tends to"

## Figures

It seems that Figure 4 will have several panels (a-h). Will the individual panels be able to be interpretable once shrunk to fit on a page with the others? The authors should consider that not all the panels need to be a part of the main publication, but some of them might be better relegated to supplemental materials. I would think that only one each of the selection and the filtering figures would be necessary in the main manuscript, and the rest could be in supplemental.

### Level of interest

Please indicate how interesting you found the manuscript:

An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

### Quality of written English

Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

### Declaration of competing interests

Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?
If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal

Do you want to get recognition for reviewing this manuscript? Add a record of this review to Publons to track and showcase your reviewing expertise across the world’s journals. Signing up is quick, easy and free!

Yes