Reviewer's report

Title: Simultaneous resection of bilateral anomalous systemic supply to the basal segments of the lungs: a case report

Version: 2  Date: 7 July 2015

Reviewer: Kichizo Kaga

Reviewer's report:

This case report may be an important contribution to medical knowledge because of the controversy over selecting a surgical procedure or a non-surgical treatment for radical treatment. Furthermore, the report has educational value regarding the use of resection for the treatment of bilateral anomalous systemic arterial supply to the basal segment of the lung, particularly owing to the rarity of this condition.

The author of this paper notes that anomalous systemic arterial supply to the basal segment of the lung is a sequestration spectrum variant. This is consistent with Pryce’s classification, which considers anomalous systemic arterial supply to the basal segment of the lung to be a type of pulmonary sequestration. However, it remains controversial whether this anomaly is a form of sequestration or an abnormality of the vasculature, as both interpretations have been described in the literature. Furthermore, Painter et al. have classified anomalous systemic arterial supply to the basal segment “without sequestration” as an independent condition.

I agree with your strategy of resecting the lung tissue in this patient, because of the presence of hemoptysis, which may be indicative of pulmonary hypertension or infection. Was the source of hemoptysis bilateral and not isolated to the left lung? Some readers may question the need for lung resection in this instance. The following points should be considered to justify this option:

1. It would be preferable to add details of pathological findings demonstrating local pulmonary hypertension or infection, if possible.
2. A discussion of studies relating to other treatment options, such as simple ligation of anomalous artery or coil embolization, may be warranted by citing references, as these techniques have produced successful results some cases, and the selection of this procedure remains controversial.
3. Finally, it would have been prudent to justify the selection of therapy, particularly as long-term data have not been available until recently.

What is the clinical significance of consolidation of the left lung, as noted in the CT report? Would this be suggestive of intralobar sequestration?

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'