Reviewer’s report

Title: Sleeve lobectomy by video-assisted thoracic surgery versus thoracotomy for non-small cell lung cancer

Version: 1 Date: 25 May 2015

Reviewer: Lorenzo Spaggiari

Reviewer’s report:

This is a very interesting and well written paper. VATS sleeve lobectomy is a complex and challenging procedure even for experienced VAST surgeons. Congratulations to the authors.

Few questions for the authors:

Discretionary Revision

1) Method: “Patients with endobronchial tumors and small tumors (tumor size < 5cm) with limited invasion of the bronchus without major vascular invasion were selected for VATS sleeve lobectomy by preoperative computed tomography of the chest and bronchofiberscopy.”

It would be useful for the reader to show a CT-scan image of a patient selected for VATS and one image of a patient included in the open group. This is to better clarify criteria of inclusion in the VATS group.

2) Surgical Technique: “All operations were performed by the same surgical team” this is not clear.

Only one surgeon preformed the 10 VATS sleeve lobectomy? If so, what is the lesson learned after 10 consecutive procedure? Reduction of the operation time was observed?

3) Discussion: “In the present study, there were no conversions to thoracotomy in the VATS group” Authors should mention possible reasons to convert to an open procedure. For example hilar lymph nodes involvement?

Minor essential revision

4) Reference style


Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'