Reviewer's report

Title: Case Report: Paravalvular Leak as a Complication of Percutaneous Catheter Ablation for Atrial Fibrillation

Version: 3 Date: 29 September 2014

Reviewer: Mehmet Aktas

Reviewer's report:

The authors present an interesting case of a patient who had undergone 2 prior mitral valve surgeries who later underwent ablation for AF. The authors noted the development of a paravalvular leak following AF ablation, which then required redo surgery. The authors bring attention to the risk of developing a paravalvular leak following AF ablation in patients with prior valve surgery.

Major Compulsory Revisions:

There are many different ablation sets performed for AF especially those with persistent AF. The authors need to describe what type of AF ablation was performed in this patient, in other words, was pulmonary vein isolation (PVI) alone performed or PVI + LA roof line, +/- mitral isthmus line, +/- ablation of continuous fractionated atrial electrograms. Also we need to know what type of ablation catheter was used and what kinds of energy (how many watts, target ablation temperatures, etc) were applied in the LA.

Also, how certain are the authors that the paravalvular leak occurred following AF ablation. The patient has undergone 2 mitral valve surgeries prior to AF ablation. Could she not have developed the PVL unrelated to the ablation?

There are major grammatical errors in the case write up. It first starts off in the past tense, switches to the present tense and back again. Please correct this.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.