Author’s response to reviews

Title: Experiences of pregnancy in adolescence of Internally Displaced Women in Bogotá: an ethnographic approach

Authors:

Yazmin Cadena Camargo (yaz_cadena@yahoo.com)
Anja Krumeich (a.krumeich@maastrichtuniversity.nl)
Maria Duque-Páramo (mcduque@javeriana.edu.co)
Klasien Horstman (k.horstman@maastrichtuniversity.nl)

Version: 3 Date: 18 Jul 2019

Author’s response to reviews:

Reviewer Comments, Author Responses and Manuscript Changes

Comment: Thank you for submitting this revision. The paper is much stronger, and most of my comments here are to help improve clarity and readability. That said, I do suggest that the Discussion section be significantly revised. In its current form, it is difficult to follow, in part because it contains such lengthy descriptions of the referenced articles. Condensing this and more explicitly referencing the major themes from your results should help. I’ve provided a specific example of how you might do this in my comments on the Discussion section.

Response: Thank you for your valuable revision. We worked on those changes and are in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: On a more minor point, there are a number of places where different conventions are used (e.g., Bogota vs. Bogotá; different capitalizations; listing workshop/IDI or not). Please review the manuscript closely to ensure these discrepancies are harmonized and that a single convention is used throughout.

Response: Thank you. We worked on those changes and are in tracked changes in the manuscript.

ABSTRACT

Comment: Line 27: women does not need to be capitalized
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: “…using an ethnographic approach. We collected…”
Ok to say that you used thematic analysis in the abstract (do not need to include the citation here, just in methods)
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: “The main themes that emerged from participants’ experiences include rural violence; early family life, characterized by violence and mistreatments at home; meanings of pregnancy at an early age, including being challenged and feelings of love; and different reactions to pregnancies during
adolescence from their families and their partners such as stigmatization."
“stigmatization”
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: “Mujeres” does not need to be capitalized
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Please add mention of the analysis methodology used (thematic analysis) to the Spanish abstract. The subthemes should also be added
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: “Rurales” does not need to be capitalized
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: “with medical, social, and economic consequences.”
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: “who experienced adolescent pregnancy in Bogotá” OR “who were pregnant as adolescents in Bogotá”.
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: “adolescent pregnancy” will be more useful in helping people find your paper than “pregnancy in adolescence” as the latter is a less common term
Similarly, maybe “internally displaced persons” is a more useful keyword?
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: The national health survey should either be written with no capitalization or as National Health Survey. Either option is ok, but capitalization should be consistent.
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: “…than among adolescents who have not been forced to migrate.”
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: I believe this proportion is a percentage – is that correct? If so, suggest revising the sentence to the following to improve clarity and flow: “In Colombia, 13.8 percent of internally displaced girls aged 15-16 are pregnant, as compared to 7.5 percent of girls of the same age who have not been displaced. Among girls aged 17-19, 36.4 percent of internally displaced girls are pregnant (or have experienced pregnancy?), compared to 28.4 percent of non-internally displaced girls of the same age.”
Also, I am not sure if the statistic is constructed such that it is just girls who are pregnant at that age, or have ever been pregnant by that age. If the latter, please adjust the suggested phrasing accordingly.
Response: Thank you for your comment. Yes, it is a percentage. We adjust the paragraph, and also pointed out that are girls who have experienced pregnancy at that age. It is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Rather than saying “one in five adolescents” here in parentheses, please include the actual figure. Is this an incidence figure or prevalence figure?
Response: Thank you for your comment. Yes, it is a prevalence of 19.5%. We adjust the paragraph. It is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: “Latin America”.
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

INTRODUCTION
Comment: No comma needed after Villarán
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Line 106 “internally displaced women in Bogotá”
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Lines 134-5: please edit here to say “possible pathways of pregnancy” to be consistent with the way you present this idea in the beginning of the introduction
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Line 195: no need to capitalize “internally displaced women”
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: The construction “IDP women” reads a bit awkwardly. Though it takes up more space, I wonder if simply saying “internally displaced women” is clearer?
Response: We agree. We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Lines 198-202: You say, “despite efforts to address pregnancy in adolescence among IDP women..” However, the context provided above is about scholarship on adolescent pregnancy, and context on the conflict in Colombia, not efforts to address (prevent?) adolescent pregnancy among IDPs. Do such efforts exist? If so, you should mention them briefly. Otherwise, it might make more sense to say something like: “Despite extensive scholarship on adolescent pregnancy generally, there is little known about how internally displaced women experience and make sense of their own pregnancies during adolescence against a background of conflict and displacement. Therefore, an ethnographic approach…”
Response: Thank you for your observation. We adjust the paragraph as you suggest. We will not go further in to the efforts to prevent adolescent pregnancies in Colombia, because it would be very extensive, and goes beyond this article. We changed the paragraph and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Line 203: I’m not sure what you mean by “get inside the development of policies and programs.” Perhaps “to inform and guide the development of policies and programs…”?
Response: Yes. We agree. We changed the paragraph and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Lines 211-214: “Alongside that, we organized workshops with internally displaced women (which were also open to other women from the receiving community) which enabled a process of sharing and exchanging experiences in a safe atmosphere, to capture their experiences, their perceptions of armed conflict, displacement and motherhood.”
Response: We changed the paragraph and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.
Comment: You note that the workshops were open to internally displaced women and other women in the community, but then you note that only internally displaced women were study participants. Did no other women attend the workshops, or was only the data from internally-displaced women included in the analysis?
Response: Thank you for your question. We only analyzed the data from the internally-displaced women, especially because the information regarding displacement and armed conflict was lived by them. In the workshops about topics such as forgiveness or motherhood for example, we paid attention to the information gave by internally displaced.

Comment: Line 224: “…with a murder occurring every other day.”
Response: We changed the paragraph and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Line 228: “the” as in “The World Health Organization” should not be capitalized
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Lines 318-319: What is the distinction here between being forced to have sexual relations and being raped/abused?
Response: There are many debates about terminology in this concern. To be more accurate, we change the terminology, and we put here ‘sexual assault’, that is defined as following:
An act of a sexual nature carried out against a person’s will through the use of physical force, intimidation or coercion, including any attempts to do this. This includes rape, attempted rape, aggravated sexual assault (assault with a weapon), indecent assault, penetration by objects, forced sexual activity that did not end in penetration, and attempts to force a person into sexual activity.

RESULTS
Comment: Line 459: Here you list “(Workshop)” after all of the quotes. This is a bit confusing, as the source of the data is not listed in other places in the manuscript. I think it makes sense to list (Name, source of data) after each quote so it is clear which quotes are coming from the workshop versus in-depth interviews.
Response: We changed it in all quotes, and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Lines 475-9: There are a lot of rich ideas packed into this paragraph. Right now, the structure reads a little bit stilted – I’ve tried to edit lightly to make your meaning come through more clearly. See if this captures what you were trying to express “They also expressed that they would like to meet all of their children’s needs and prevent them from suffering. However, they also reflected that they were sometimes frustrated or dissatisfied by how they were raising their children. Women noted that their children felt they lacked their mother’s time, attention, and love; that they experienced deprivation; and that they, too, were affected by the displacement.”
Response: Thank you. We changed the paragraph and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

DISCUSSION
Comment: Right now, the discussion is quite lengthy and features far more explanation of other studies than of how this study adds to that literature. The findings of your study are important and deserve to be highlighted more in this section. I think it would help to condense some of the discussion of the other papers so you have space to explain how your results fit in and help complete the picture. For example, the paragraph on the first theme might be revised to say something like:
“Rural violence was a major theme of participants’ life stories. This included violence caused by armed
groups, but also structural and interpersonal violence within home settings. Women reported that
experiences of interpersonal violence at home often pushed them to leave their family home, and to
seek romantic relationship with a male partner (who may have been a member of an armed group) in
order to experience safety and stability. Many of the participants in this study reported early
experiences of sexual coercion and violence.
Structural violence in the form of poverty and lack of opportunities is well-documented in Colombia
[citation] and is worse in rural than in urban areas [citation]. Childhood experiences of poverty, lack of
opportunity and interpersonal violence have been reported by women who experienced adolescent
pregnancy in contexts as varied as the Democratic Republic of Congo, [insert others] [citations].
Authors such as Zanchi and Harden suggest that girls living in unfavourable contexts, (i.e., who
obtained little education, had limited future employment prospects, or lived in otherwise difficult
circumstances), were likely to live in similar situations as adults and often understood early entry into
motherhood not as a problem, but as a natural progression in life that would not cause them harm. This
sentiment was echoed by participants in our study.
Interpersonal and sexual violence is also widely reported in the literature as a contributing factor to
early pregnancy…”
Framing the paragraphs to more explicitly follow the thematic structure of the Results section helps the
reader understand how the themes you uncovered tie into the other papers you are discussing. We are
most interested in your findings, so you do not need to spend so much time explaining each of the other
papers in their full complexity (with the citations, readers can go in and review that additional detail
themselves).
Response: Thank you for your suggestion. We modified the discussion section and it is in track
changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Lines 491: change to “pathways of pregnancy”
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Line 500: “It” should not be capitalized
Response: We changed it and it is in tracked changes in the manuscript.

Comment: Line 561: This is the first place in the manuscript where it is mentioned that women had
children fathered by different partners. Either bring up in the results or remove from discussion
Response: Thank you for your comment. We added a paragraph and a quote it in the results. It is with
track changes lines 456 to 460.

Comment: Lines 596-598: This “limitation” could apply to any qualitative study. Please revise this
section to reflect specifically on limitations to this study. For example, coding was only conducted by
one person. While themes were discussed with other authors, other authors were not involved in coding
the raw data. It is possible that the coders’ positionality influenced the way the transcripts were coded.
This would also be an appropriate place to reflect on the first authors’ positionality. While familiarity
with the community members likely improved the sense of trust and familiarity, it could also affect
how/what participants choose to disclose. Ditto the affiliation with the Vidas Móviles program.
Similarly, I think it is worth explaining here how recall can change over time, and so, while there is a
risk of recall bias in the traditional sense because of the time elapsed since displacement, there is also a
chance for differential meaning-making. The comment you provided in response to the last round of
reviewer comments is valuable and worth including in the manuscript.
Response: Thank you for your comment. We modified this section and it is in tracked changes in the
manuscript. Nevertheless, we differ regarding the point of recall bias. We explained as following:
‘We analysed life-stories, which are the construction about their lives, from their perspective in a moment of life. It is specifically on how they constructed on their own lives. In that sense, there is not recall bias, because it is not about the “true”, but instead, it is about on how they construct their lives, even if the pregnancy or the displacement occurred long time ago’.

We also differ about the author’s positionality as a bias. We think that the interview is a process of construction that includes the interaction between the interviewer and the interviewee. It is dynamic and part of the essence of the interview itself. We add a paragraph in the section of limitations as following:

‘People from the neighborhood known the first author as a physician and as part of the project Vidas Móviles. Participants in the study expressed that condition as a plus, because they trusted the researcher and felt that they could share their experiences, including medical issues’.