Author’s response to reviews

Title: Experiences of pregnancy in adolescence of Internally Displaced Women in Bogotá: an ethnographic approach

Authors:

Yazmin Cadena Camargo (yaz_cadena@yahoo.com)
Anja Krumeich (a.krumeich@maastrichtuniversity.nl)
Maria Duque-Páramo (mcduje@javeriana.edu.co)
Klasien Horstman (k.horstman@maastrichtuniversity.nl)

Version: 2 Date: 17 Jun 2019

Author’s response to reviews:

Yazmin Cadena Camargo
Maastricht University
The Netherlands
Pontificia Universidad Javeriana
Bogotá, Colombia

Dr. Caitlin Williams
Editorial Manager
Reproductive Health
https://reproductive-health-journal.biomedcentral.com/
June 17, 2019
Subject: Revision and resubmission of manuscript REPH-D-18-00307R1

Dear Dr Williams,

Thank you for the opportunity to revise our paper on “Experiences of pregnancy in adolescence of Internally Displaced Women in Bogotá: an ethnographic approach”. The suggestions offered by the reviewers have been very helpful, and we appreciate the insightful comments on the paper.

I have included the reviewer comments immediately after this letter and responded to them individually, indicating exactly how we addressed each concern and describing the changes we have made. The revisions have been approved by all four authors and I have again been chosen as the corresponding author. The changes are marked in red in the paper as you requested, and the revised manuscript is attached to this letter.

We hope the revised manuscript will better suit Reproductive Health but are happy to consider further revisions, and we thank you for your continued interest in our research.
Sincerely,
Yazmin Cadena Camargo
Maastricht University
The Netherlands
Pontificia Universidad Javeriana
Bogotá, Colombia

Yazmin Cadena Camargo
Maastricht University
The Netherlands
Pontificia Universidad Javeriana
Bogotá, Colombia

Dr. Caitlin Williams
Editorial Manager
Reproductive Health
https://reproductive-health-journal.biomedcentral.com/
June 17, 2019
Subject: Revision and resubmission of manuscript REPH-D-18-00307R1

Dear Dr Williams,

Dr. Maria Claudia Duque-Paramo, who is the third author of this manuscript, is not working anymore with the Pontificia Universidad Javeriana, that was the affiliation she had in the last version of the manuscript. She retired. She expressed the desire to make it clear in the manuscript.
We made the changes in red in the new version of the manuscript.
Thank you for your attention and support.

Sincerely,

Yazmin Cadena Camargo
Maastricht University
The Netherlands
Pontificia Universidad Javeriana
Bogotá, Colombia

Reviewer Comments, Author Responses and Manuscript Changes
Reviewer #1: Overall, good paper. Please consider addressing the given below points for the further process.

Abstract:
- Methods:
- Comment: Please specify the analytical approach that you used for the analysis of the results. It will also be good to discuss about the ethnographic approach.
Response: Thank you for your comment. We used the thematic analysis proposed by Miles et al. (Miles & Huberman, 1994). Regarding the ethnographic approach, we chose it because it is holistic, contextual, reflexive and presented from the emic perspectives, meaning from the perspectives of the members of the cultural groups involved (Trochim, 2006).
Change: We specified the analytical approach and the use of an ethnographic approach in the manuscript in the methodological part and in the abstract (track changes).

- Comment: Good to specify number of participants who participated in the workshop.
  Response: We agree with your comment. In the workshops participated mainly the same participants who were interviewed, nevertheless, other women from the community were welcomed as well. The workshops had from 18 to 30 participants.
  Change: We specified it in the abstract and the main manuscript (track changes).

- Results:
  - Comment: The major themes are not the same as specified under the main text. There is not a clear distinction of themes and sub-themes, which makes it difficult for the readers to comprehend.
  Response: Thank you for your comment. The themes in the abstract are the same in the results but with the words of participants. To make it clear, we added the same names in to the results.
  Change: We included in the results the themes, as is stated in the abstract (track changes) and in the main manuscript.

- Comment: Consider expanding the results section as opposed to conclusion. In the conclusion section, you could simply state a summary of everything in a sentence or two.
  Response: We appreciate your suggestion. We expand the results section in the abstract.
  Change: We modify the results in the abstract (track changes).

- Conclusion:
  - Comment: What do you mean by "feelings of ownership"?
  Response: As it is explain in the results and discussion in the main manuscript, participants expressed that as mothers, they would like to supply all the needs of their children, and that they worked hard to do so. They felt committed by motherhood.

- Comment: Any results from the observation?
  Response: Yes. But this specific research were focused on the life stories of the IDP women.

- Comment Recommendation might not be possible, only based on this ethnographic study. There may be a need of further study to strengthen the findings and inform policy makers.
  Response: We appreciate your opinion. Nevertheless, there are few studies about pregnancy among adolescents in this specific population of internally displaced persons. In this sense, we think that our study could give some glimpses for policy makers about this topic in this particular population, and also promote further research.

Plain English Summary:
- Comment: Page 4, Line 71-72: This has not been discussed under the abstract.
  Response: Thanks for your point. We discussed under the abstract in lines 41 and 42: “Our in-depth analysis of the in-depth interviews and the workshops suggests that pregnancy in adolescence among women who are internally displaced has complex dynamics, including their violent context in the rural areas but mainly violence experienced during their childhood”.
Background:

- Comment: May require editing for grammar and paraphrasing of sentences.
  Page 4-5, Line 91-93: Too many use of "this", better to state it. Need to paraphrase this sentence. There is no need for separate introduction and background section.
  Response: Thank you for your suggestion. We replace “this topic” by ‘it’ in line 97. We agree with you and made only one section as “Introduction”
  Change: We modified the paragraph (track changes). We deleted the ‘Background” subtitle.

- Comment: Page 8, Line 165-170: Not sure if all these explanations are required under the background section. It is unclear, why this study was required. May need to strengthen the rationale section.
  Response: Thank you for your comment. We think that this paragraph about the armed conflict in Colombia is necessary, because we had participants who were displaced by different armed groups, and were living in the same neighbourhood in Bogotá. This is relevant because permits the reader understand the complexity of the situation in the rural areas as well as in the neighbourhood. The purpose of the study is stated in lines 175 to 179. “Despite the effort to address PA among IDW, there is still a lack of information of how IDW can understand from their experiences. It is important to connect to the perspectives of these displaced women and understand how they give meaning to PA to deal with problems of “reach”.

Methods:

- Comment: Consider discussing about the approach used, analytical methods.
  Response: We appreciate your comment. We used thematic analysis proposed by Miles et al. (Miles & Huberman, 1994) in the context of the ethnographic approach.
  Change: We modified the paragraph. It is with track changes.

- Comment: Settings and participants: Discuss about the age group of participants in this section.
  Response: We agree. We change the location of the paragraph about participants and we relocated it in this section.
  Change: It is relocated in this section (track changes).

- Comment: Page 9, Line 199: Earlier it was mentioned that the observation was for 1 year; however, you mention conducting field work in the following 2 years.
  Response: Thank you for your question. The main field work, when the interviews and the 6 workshops were done took part in the first year. Nevertheless, the first author visited the community irregularly in the follow year, and in that year the last 2 workshops were carried out.
  Change: We modified the time of the field work as 2 years in the abstract as well.

Results:

- Comment: The results of the study are very interesting; however, need proper categorization of major themes and sub-themes that makes it clearer to understand.
  Response: We agree. We added to the subtitiles the name of the theme in order to have a better comprehension.
  Change: We modified the subtitiles with the name of the themes (track changes).
- Comment: Themes presented in the results section are different than that of abstract.
Response: Thank you. See previous point.
- Comment: Names listed in the quotations: Are they changed names? Do not use the real name of the participant. You could just specify the age group of women rather than stating their name.
Response: Thank you for your comment. As we stated in the ethical part, line 257: "We protected the identity of the participants by changing their names in the text”.

- Comment: Consider presenting Table 1, with the demographics of study participants.
Response: Thank you for your suggestion. However, we do not consider that the table could provide more relevant information. We chose to show their narratives giving them priority, as the article is already long.

Discussions:
- Comment: Would suggest discussing the main findings by putting it into context (interpret your findings and compare findings with other studies, whenever applicable).
Response: Thank you for your suggestion. We made some changes to the discussion part.
Change: Changes are marked as track changes.

- Comment: In order to make your discussion section engaging, you should include the following information:
- The major findings of your study
- The meaning of those findings
- How these findings relate to what others have done
- Limitations of your findings
- An explanation for any surprising, unexpected, or inconclusive results
- Suggestions for further research
Response: Thank you for your suggestion. We made some changes to the discussion part.
Change: Changes are marked as track changes

Conclusion:
- This section needs further development: synthesis of key points rather that summary of points.
Response: Thank you for your suggestion. We made some changes to the discussion part.
Change: Changes are marked as track changes

Reviewer #2: Experiences of pregnancy in adolescence of Internally Displaced Women in Bogotá: an ethnographic approach by Cadena-Camargo et al

- Comment: This is an important topic to discuss. I am a little concerned about the fact that women are speaking about an event that occurred 4-20 years previously. The information presented is interesting, but I think the writing could be tightened up a bit. I am not an expert in ethnographic research, so some of my comments may be inappropriate for this type of research. In addition, some of my comments are related to terminology. Most of my comments are suggestions rather than mandatory.
Response: Thank you for your comment. We see your point. Our participants were pregnant during adolescence, and their age vary from 19 to 35. We use the analysis of life stories that are in fact about how they construct their experiences. We think that according to the methodology used, life stories are the construction about their lives, from their perspective. It is specifically on how they constructed on
their own lives. In that sense, there is not bias, because it is not about the “true”, but instead, of that, it is about how they constructed their lives, even if the pregnancy occurred long time ago.

Introduction
- Comment: Line 85: do you have the actual figure for pregnancy incidence among adolescents in Colombia (rather than saying one in five)?
Response: Thank you for your question. Yes. The adolescent fertility rate is 84 births per 1000 adolescent women, in 2010 (Martes-Camargo, 2015). Pregnancy rates among adolescents year 2010 was 19.5% (ICBF, 2015)
Change: The figures are mentioned in the main text in lines 84 to 90.
- Comment: Line 85: I don't think PA is a common acronym. I would recommend writing out ‘pregnancy in adolescence’
Response: Thank you for your comment. We changed in all the document the acronym by writing out “pregnancy in adolescence”.
Change: We changed in all the document the acronym by writing out “pregnancy in adolescence”.
- Comment: Line 88: 'possible ways of pregnancy' sounds awkward to me. If this is a common term that I just do not know, please ignore this comment. I am assuming this refers to the circumstances in which these women became pregnant in adolescence. I wonder if 'pathways to pregnancy' might be better.
Response: Thank you for your comment. We agree on the use of the term “pathways” instead of ways.
Change: We changed the term in the manuscript (track changes).

Background
- Comment: Line 135: replace 'resumed' with 'summarized'
Response: Thank you for your suggestion. We changed the term.
Change: We changed the term (tracked changes)
- Comment: Line 169: I don't think IDW is a common acronym. 'IDP women' would be better.
Response: Thank you for your comment. We changed the acronym by “IDP women”.
Change: We changed the acronym by “IDP women” (tracked changes).
- Comment: Line 172-173: I don't quite understand the second half of this sentence: It is important to connect to the perspectives of these displaced women and understand how they give meaning to PA to deal with problems of "reach".
Response: Thank you for your comment.
Change: We change the sentence (track changes).

Methods
- Comment: Were there any other criteria for recruiting women into the study beyond the fact that they had a pregnancy during adolescence?
Response: Thank you for your question. As is mentioned in the methods, participants were women from 19 to 35 years old, who had their first pregnancy during adolescence, that were displaced, and that were living in the neighbourhood during the time of fieldwork.
Change: We changed and made it clear in the document (track changes).

- Comment: Line 200: Where all of the respondents IDPs when they were pregnant? Or were the criteria that the women are currently internally displaced but they may or may not have been IDPs as adolescents?
Response: Thanks. They had their first pregnancy during adolescence and before the displacement.  
Change: We changed and made it clear in the document (track changes).

- Comment: Line 203: as you describe your sample, could you perhaps indicate partnered status at the time of the pregnancy (ie were they married or in a relationship at the time)?  
Response: Their partnered status at the time of the pregnancy varied. Some of them had a partner, some of them were single.  
Change: It is explained better in the results, section 3, lines 387 to 393.  
- Comment: Line 209: How often were these 8 workshops scheduled: weekly? Monthly? Other frequency? It would be helpful to have an idea of the duration of the data collection time period.  
Response: Thank you. The first 6 workshops took place in the first year of field work, one every two months. The last two workshops were intended to have a feedback of the analysis of this study and took place in the first semester of the second year of fieldwork.  
Change: We specified it in the manuscript (track changes).  
- Comment: Lines 223-228: Was the first author the only one who coded the transcripts or did more than one person code transcripts in Nvivo?  
Response: It was made by the first author only, but were discussed with the other authors.  

Results  
- Comment: Line 262: 'women were asked at times to have sexual relationships…' Asked or forced or maybe pressured? Asked here suggests the women could refuse - could they?  
Response: Thank you for your question. Were forced, and also raped. In the context of the armed conflict, participants explained how they cannot refused.  
Change: We made the changes.  
- Comment: Lines 267-281: This quote could perhaps be shortened a bit - maybe stopping at line 278?  
Response: Thank you for your suggestion.  
Change: We shortened the quote. (track changes)  
- Comment: Line 291: this says the following quote is illustrative of the believe that PA relates to suffering in childhood. The quote certainly illustrates a difficult family life and shows why she left home, but doesn't necessarily show the link to PA. Perhaps you could make this more explicit?  
Response: Thank you for your comment. It is showing the violence at home, and how she left her home. Nevertheless, the connection with the early pregnancy in this section is explicit in Silvia’s comment, lines 349 to 355.  
- Comment: Line 319: this linking of the difficult home circumstances with the girls escaping seems to be a major theme of this section - as in my previous comment. Perhaps somewhere in here, you can say that this leaving home made the girls perhaps more vulnerable to PA?  
Response: Thank you for your comment.  
Change: We made it explicit in the paragraph, lines 356 to 361. (track changes).  
- Comment: Line 353: You comment that some women said they did not pay attention to family planning - did they say why? Is this due to a lack of knowledge about FP? Lack of access? They didn't think it was important?  
Response: Thank you for your question. Yes, they did not considered important, as Olga stated in line 384: “…but in the village, you don’t mind so much to that” regarding use of condoms.  

- Comment: Line 356: the last 'it' in this sentence - does this refer to the pregnancy? They didn't use FP because they wanted to be pregnant? If yes, the quotes in lines 357-361 do not suggest to me that the women wanted to get pregnant.
Response: Thank you for your comment. Yes, we agree. They do not wanted, but they wanted to please their partner, as Sonia mentioned.

Change: We adjusted the sentence (track changes)
- Comment: Line 387: does (workshop) mean these 3 quotes were from the workshops while all others were from the in depth interviews?
Response: Yes.

- Comment: Line 399: to be consistent with other quotes, 'Lourdes' should follow the quote in parentheses.
Response: Yes, we agree.
Change: We put the name at the end of the quote (track changes)
- Comment: Line 402 and 404: I would suggest using a different word from 'commodities' here - commodities to me indicates supplies for a program, not things an individual would have or give.
Response: Yes, we agree.
Change: We change the sentence as “They also expressed that they would like to supply all their children needs and prevent them from suffering” (tracked changes).
- Comment: Line 405: '….from their mothers [perhaps replace with themselves], or even the history [perhaps replace with experience] of displacement'
Response: We agree.
Change: We changed the terms (track changes)
- Comment: Is there anything about why they think they failed as moms when they said they wanted to be different from their own mothers?
Response: They expressed their frustration and they related to displacement. As Francisca explained in lines 433-437.

Discussion
- Comment: Line 430: 'the analysis shows that this rural environment where the participants grew up, was not only violent because of the armed conflict, but is also violent in the sense of poverty and lack of opportunities lived in these rural areas'. I'm not exactly sure these are all separate issues. The violence in the home may also be linked to the conflict and general violence in the community (ie when violence becomes the norm). Perhaps soften this statement so they don't seem like unique issues rather than interconnected ones.
Response: Yes. We agree.
Change: We modified the paragraph (track changes).
- Comment: Line 435: 'Despite violence suffered, the reduction of daily stressors in the life of adolescents affected by war could promote resilience and minimize to a certain extent the psychological symptoms caused by the stress accumulated by war'. Maybe this reduction of daily stressors could also help the girls to handle stress?
Response: Yes. That would be one of the aims of policies for IDP, who try to provide them safety and better conditions of life once they arrive in to the cities. (El Congreso de la República, 2011)

- Comment: Line 437-440: I'm sorry but this sentence is not clear: 'In addition, Zanchi made it clear that girls in unfavourable contexts, who did not hold a study culture, or did not have a promising future or a comfortable level in their living situation, would have a future equal to the environment where they lived, with an understanding and belief that motherhood will not interfere in their life and will not cause them harm.' For example, I don't know what you mean by the girls 'did not hold a study culture'?
Perhaps this sentence could be re-written to be more clear?
Response: Yes, thank you for your comment.
Change: We change the sentence (tracked changes).
- Comment: Line 448: You mention that some girls lived with a man who was an active actor in the armed conflict? Do you have a quote where they mention this? I may have missed it but this seems the first mention of who the partners of these girls were. It seems like discussion of who the partners were of these girls when they became pregnant might be important.
Response: Thank you for your question. Participants lived in the rural areas in an armed conflict area. Many of them were farmers, but because of the context and the history of the guerrilla and paramilitarian groups in rural areas, the farmers are connected with the armed groups in different senses. It is not difficult to have a family member or partner who is part of those illegal groups, because as in mentioned in the article, they are in the villages.
Change: We made this explicit in the results, in the 3rd section (track changes).
- Comment: Line 463: You mention that participants said it was difficult to talk about sex with their mothers - this doesn't appear anywhere in the Results but is first mentioned here in the Discussion.
Response: Thank you for your comment. We add a quotation about that, from Sandy’s story. Line 389.
Change: We added a quotation. (tracked changes),
- Comment: I think the writing could be tightened up a bit. Several times in the Discussion, I thought that a theme was mentioned for the first time, and had to look back into the Results only to find a small mention of it. Although I hate to say reduce the references, I think the Discussion could perhaps be strengthened by discussing your results a bit more. Or at least linking your results more directly to the other references you cite.
Response: Thank you for your comment. We modified the discussion. (Tracked changes).

Conclusion
- Comment: Line 507: 'Motherhood represents an ideal opportunity to achieve fulfilment'. This seems like a judgmental statement - what is the evidence for this? Perhaps soften it rather than make it a statement.
Response: Thank you. We modified the conclusion (tracked changes).

- Comment: I think you should include a Limitations section - this is particularly important since you interviewed women 4-20 years after the pregnancy they are discussing. I think recall bias is important to note. Also, if the author who conducted the interviews was also the only person coding the data, that seems a limitation to me as well. Or at least should be mentioned somewhere in the paper.
Response: Thank you for your comment. We see your point. We included a limitation section (tracked changes). Nevertheless, we think that according to the methodology used, life stories are the construction about their lives, from their perspective. It is specifically on how they constructed on their own lives. In that sense, there is not bias, because it is not about the “true”, but instead, it is about on how they construct their lives, even if the pregnancy occurred long time ago.

References: