Reviewer’s report

Title: The Cross-Sectional Average Length of Healthy Life (HCAL): A measure that summarizes the history of cohort health and mortality

Version: 0 Date: 27 Jan 2020

Reviewer: Elena Riza

Reviewer's report:

This is an interesting paper, however it is too technical and too specific for most health professionals. The methodology is described in detail but the practical implications of the new indicator HCAL are not clearly discussed. I believe the authors should be more descriptive on the net advantages of the new measure in relation to its practical applications in population health, perhaps giving some examples.

Moreover, some limitations are not discussed in terms of the potentially generalised application of the measure, such as the effect of quality and completeness of the data used, mostly in terms of accurate recording of life course events, as well as the variation across different countries and different health systems e.g. use of disease classification systems in different countries.

With these additions, the paper will apply to the interests of a larger proportion of health researchers.

Level of interest
Please indicate how interesting you found the manuscript:

An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal