**Reviewer’s report**

**Title:** ‘Everything was just getting worse and worse’: deteriorating job quality as a driver of doctor emigration from Ireland

**Version:** 0  **Date:** 28 Jul 2019

**Reviewer:** Exequiel Cabanda

**Reviewer's report:**

The paper examines the issue of deteriorating job quality as one of the main drivers of doctor's emigration. Although there is a volume of literature that discusses this issue, the paper provides a fresh dimension considering that Ireland is also one of destination countries for foreign-educated health professionals, which also include doctors. I have some few comments to strengthen the substantive parts of this paper. In its current form, this paper lacks some essential elements that could contribute to goals of Human Resources for Health (HRH).

1. Economic factors—low salary, poor benefits, etc.—are discussed in the literature as key factors for the emigration of doctors (especially in the global south). The paper should emphasize this set of factors to highlight the value added of using Ireland as a case. This aspect is missing in the introduction as well as in the discussion part of the paper.

2. The authors mentioned that there has been a long tradition of emigration from Ireland and these doctors usually return; this "culture" has been regarded as beneficial rather than harmful (p. 3). If this is the case, what is the problem of this migration stream? Did you ask your respondents if they want to comeback? If yes, what percentage? If they will not comeback, then this should be a very important issue to highlight. For now, your arguments are less convincing.

3. The authors have mentioned about Hirschman's work (p. 3 and p. 8) as their framework (?) but they did not substantially discuss what is his work all about and how this relates to the value added of this paper. In the revised version, there should be a discussion at the onset about this framework.

Following the revision based on the comments above, I recommend the publication of this paper to the HRH.
Level of interest
Please indicate how interesting you found the manuscript:

An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal