Reviewer's report

Title: The impacts of training pathways and experiences during intern year on doctor emigration from Ireland

Version: 0 Date: 28 Jun 2019

Reviewer: G Y M Alsheikh

Reviewer's report:

HRHE-D-17-00080R1

The impact of training pathways and early career experience on doctor emigration

By Frances Mary Cronin et al.

Reviewer's Report: 28-06-2019

I sincerely appreciate the great efforts exerted by the authors in producing this good project tackling a "hot" challenge facing large number of OECD countries. The manuscript is well written and analysis is superb. However, I find the study population and sample used in the study unacceptable and needs serious consideration. The study divided the population of the locally medical graduates as being (1) Irish/EU students, (2) Outside EU students. According to the WHO Global Code of Practice on the International Recruitment of Health Personnel which was endorsed by all member states in the 63rd World Health Assembly, May 2010*, the issue of international immigration addresses the member states and their national health systems. The current study is addressing emigration from Ireland and its national health system. The sample included graduates from EU in addition to the nationals of Ireland as one category. No doubt, such sample is not representing a homogenous targeted sample of Irish nationals and so affects the analysed choices. As they are studying the effects of Irish national health system, authors need to reconsider this issue and include only nationals of Ireland. I find it difficult to justify recommending the study for publication. Certainly, nationals from other EU countries have different reasons for "emigrating" from Ireland when compared to nationals of Ireland. The migration of doctors from one EU member state to other EU member state is a completely different and complex issue. https://www.who.int/hrh/migration/code/code_en.pdf

Level of interest
Please indicate how interesting you found the manuscript:

An exceptional article

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable
Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal.