Reviewer's report

Title: A 3-biomarker-panel predicts renal outcome in chronic kidney disease patients

Version: 1  Date: 12 July 2014

Reviewer: Gianluigi Zaza

Reviewer's report:

Authors have validated a panel of three genes in kidney biopsies which predicted serum creatinine at follow-up and therefore might serve as biomarkers for kidney disease progression.

Although the paper written and Hannes et coll is interesting, it has some limitations:

Major Compulsory revisions

1. This study is mainly focused on a subset of patients with proteinuria/glomerulonephritis. Searching for CKD biomarkers required a larger dataset (CKD is a clinical condition extremely heterogeneous). Therefore, I really suggest to change the manuscript title.

2. Please include more demographic and clinical data (for example blood pressure, cholesterol levels, smoking habit…). If not available, please state this limitation in the discussion.

3. What about GFR? GFR is generally used for CKD classification. If possible (available) please use GFR instead that Serum Creatinine.

4. A single measurement of serum creatinine during the follow-up looks not enough. Please include a numerical variable showing the variability of Creatinine/GFR during-time (for example you could measure the delta of Creatinine/GFR or slope of Creatinine/GFR over-time). Then, this variable should be correlated with gene expression.

5. The paper is based on gene expression (large list of transcripts). However, a functional analysis could be useful to reader to better understand the biological role of your selected genes (for example, you could use ingenuity pathway analysis, GSEA). If not available, please state this limitation in the discussion.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests