Author’s response to reviews

Title:A meta-analysis of the performance of the PimaTM CD4 for point of care testing

Authors:

Lesley E Scott (lesley.scott@nhls.ac.za)
Jennifer Campbell (jcampbell@clintonhealthaccess.org)
Larry Westerman (lew2@cdc.gov)
Luc Kestens (LKestens@itg.be)
Lara Vojnov (lvojnov@clintonHealthAccess.org)
Luciana Kohatsu (iee2@cdc.gov)
John Nkengasong (jcn5@cdc.gov)
Trevor Peter (tpeter@clintonhealthaccess.org)
Wendy Stevens (wendy.stevens@nhls.ac.za)

Version:5 Date:9 June 2015

Author’s response to reviews: see over
Dr Lin Lee  
Deputy Editor  
BMC Medicine  
9th June 2015

Dear Dr Lee

Re-submission of a manuscript titled “A meta-analysis of the performance of the PIMA CD4 for point of care testing”

Thank you for this opportunity to re-submit our manuscript with further improvements. We have addressed the reviewer’s comments as itemized below and tracked changes in the document.

Reviewer report:
While the authors failed to present any data or analysis in support their recommendations on the appropriate use of Pima, they do include references to a couple of recent POC cost-effectiveness studies that are models for what should be done before making a recommendation. In this case, the recommendations come from a very knowledgeable group of authors, but they are not derived directly for data presented. I would have preferred a conclusion that "additional studies can now be undertaken to determine the impact Pima could have on outcomes and costs." However, I don't want to hold up publication of their analysis of Pima performance, since this is well within the norm, and Pima is not likely to be widely adapted because viral load is a far superior test. I'm OK with accepting the revised manuscript for publication in BMC Medicine

We have modified and tracked changes to the conclusion in our manuscript by adding the following sentence: 'additional studies can now be undertaken to determine the impact Pima CD4 could have on outcomes and costs'. The words “and impact” have also been included in the conclusion of the abstract, which already did state that a full costing analysis be required.

Yours sincerely

Lesley Scott, PhD  
Associate Professor  
Department of Molecular Medicine and Haematology  
Faculty of Health Sciences, University of the Witwatersrand  
7 York Road Parktown, Johannesburg, South Africa  
+27 11 489 8567 (t)  
+27 11 484 5812 (f)  
Lesley.scott@nhls.ac.za