Reviewer's report

Title: Global mental health and neuroethics

Version: 2 Date: 8 August 2014

Reviewer: Sivasankaran P Sashidharan

Reviewer's report:

It is hard to see what this article is trying to achieve. The authors state that their focus is “intersections between global mental health and neuroethics” but such “intersections” are not fully delineated or set out in the article. They are really considering four areas of concern, long recognised and subject of much debate and discussion in mental health and, providing an ethical (“neuroethical”) perspective on these. The authors also do not explain fully what is meant by “neuroethics”, how this differs from bioethics or, in this particular context, biomedical ethics.

The authors do not make it clear why “global mental health” has been chosen as the focus for this discussion. The four areas that they consider in the article (evidence based medicine, health and wellbeing vs disorder, human rights in mental health and priority setting, social inclusion / consumer movements) are not specific challenges faced by global mental health but common themes (and topics of intense debate) within the mental health field as a whole. They encompass professional as well as general discourses in relation to mental health / mental health care rather than something specific in relation to what has come to be known as global mental health. Their analysis of these four topics (and how neuroethics have acknowledged some of the concerns) is not in itself novel or nor does it add significantly to current debates.

The article has an unusual structure. The initial abstract is followed by Background and then a section titled Discussion. There is a lack of conceptual coherence and absence of any meaningful analysis.

My recommendation is that the authors should be asked to undertake a major revision of the article and resubmit it for further review.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests.