Reviewer's report

Title: An international comparison of deceased and living organ donation rates in opt-in and opt-out systems: a panel study

Version: 1 Date: 8 April 2014

Reviewer: Martí Manyalich

Reviewer's report:

The article “An international comparison of deceased and living organ donation rates in opt-in and opt-out systems: a panel study” presented a good and completely analysis of the two types of donor consent opt-out and opt-in. However there comes important to highlight the following:

1. The increase of the donation rates is multi-causal; it shouldn’t be limited to consider the attribute of only one strategy to the enhancement of deceased organ donation rates.

2. It’s important to remark the needs of further analysis in order to determine the effect of opt-out system in the improvement of the donor rates.

3. It’s important to determine how the opt-out system is being applied in the countries where it exists. The implementation of the opt-out law varies from country to country and it could affect the effect of the consent system.

4. The opt-in and opt out consent is applicable to the deceased organ donation not in living donation. The living donation is only a supplement to the deceased donation as it is stated in the principals of WHO. More specifications regarding Living Donation are needed. Depending to the relation living donor-recipient there are different approaches to the willingness for donation.

5. Although Australia and UK are interested in applying Spanish Model, until today the Model is not implemented yet. One of the main pillars of Spanish model is the strong role of the intensive care doctors in the deceased organ donation process.

6. A recommendation for the researches for further investigation in this field is to include the type of organ donation system (OPO vs Spanish Model)

Specific comments to the author:

1- Pg 5 – 1st paragraph: When it is presented the aim of the study it comes not clear the consideration is for:

- the donors are counted as per “total number of donors” or there are considered as per “pmp”?
- When it comes to living transplant organs must be defined the specific organ.

2- Define the same term: - In the introduction and methodology it is referred to “hospitals beds” meanwhile in the discussion the term used is “ICU beds”.

3- great importance must be given to the IROdat reference. It should be included
using any published article about the registry.

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interest.