Reviewer's report

Title: Clinics and Churches: Lifeworlds and health-seeking practices of older women with noncommunicable disease in rural South Africa

Version: 3 Date: 21 February 2015

Reviewer: Kenneth L Leonard

Reviewer's report:

On page 23 the authors state that they adopted the theory of communicative action, "which suggests that individual approach health care encounters not to maximize health, but to generate common understandings between participants regarding the nature of illness and its implications for life change." Earlier they use the term "communicative action" to refer to the full set of behaviors people might undertake to generate common understandings.

The difference in the two statements of the theory are illustrative. It seems to me, based on what is reported, that the women in this study do not seek an interpretation of their condition from health facilities, but rather through communication with their husbands, families and churches.

One of the women stated that she received information and advice from the health facility, but I think most of the others received very little feedback (except perhaps not to mix pills with alcohol). Their sources of information on the "illness of nowadays" were family, friends and television.

Overall, the NDCs reported seem not be rise to the level of "phenomenon" and perhaps, not surprisingly the women appear not to be overly engaged in these conditions. Compared to not being in touch with one’s children, high blood pressures seems an afterthought.

The new version of the paper is very long on theory and short on information about these women.

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests