Author’s response to reviews

Title: Developing an Adapted Charlson Comorbidity Index for Ischemic Stroke Outcome Studies

Authors:

Ruth Hall (ruth@ices.on.ca)
Joan Porter (joan.porter@ices.on.ca)
Hude Quan (hquan@ucalgary.ca)
Mathew Reeves (reevesm@epi.msu.edu)

Version: 2 Date: 03 Oct 2019

Author’s response to reviews:

Responses to Reviewer 1 and Editor

Reviewer 1:

After proofreading this version we have revised some of the discussion to improve readability. See line 213-228 and we have highlighted the section.

They have addressed my comment by providing details of reasons why other stroke-related risk factors were not included in the discussion (smoking, obesity and hypertension), but details of how variables were selected should provided in the methods.

We have included more detail in the methods section beginning on line 93, at line 101-105, at line 115-116 and we have highlighted the wording.

In addition, the list of other variables that were provided in the discussion is not an exhaustive list of major stroke risk factors. A more objective methodology related to variable selection is warranted. The authors have also stated that smoking and obesity are absent in administrative data, but there are ICD-10 codes for these, so the part of the discussion that addresses this comment needs to be revised.

We recognize the stroke risk factors listed is not exhaustive but many of the other risk factors such as, poor dietary intake, inactivity, stress are not considered medical conditions. We have added further rationale for our selection of the three variables, thank you for this suggestion. We have also commented on the prevalence and unreliability of smoking and obesity identified through diagnostic codes. See Discussion, line 242-245 highlighted text. Three new references have been added.
Have revised

Editor:

The corresponding authors email is include on the title page. We have created a list of abbreviations after the Conclusion section, made corrections to the section and declaration headings.

ICES is ICES as of 2019, it is no longer called the Institute for Clinical Evaluative Sciences.