Reviewer’s report

Title: Do Choosing Wisely recommendations about low-value care target income-generating treatments provided by members? A content analysis of 1293 recommendations

Version: 0 Date: 30 Jun 2019

Reviewer: Marc Saez

Reviewer's report:

The authors tries to determine the proportion of Choosing Wisely recommendations targeting income-generating treatments, and whether society recommendations on income-generating treatments are more likely to target members or non member; as well as the prevalence of qualified statements, and if qualified statements are more likely to appear in recommendations targeting income or non-income-generating treatments that apply to members. The authors have been quite successful in achieving their objectives. In fact, I only have one minor comment.

All the inference made by the authors is bivariate. I wonder if they could make some multivariate inference or, in any case, stratify the inference made. The authors should try it or, if they can not do it, explain it in the discussion.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess
Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?
5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?
6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?
If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below.

If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

'I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal