Reviewer’s report

Title: Do newly marketed generic medicines expand markets using descriptive time series analysis and mixed logit models? Korea as an exemplar and its implications

Version: 0 Date: 20 Jan 2016

Reviewer: Maria Pia Fantini

Reviewer's report:

The study by Godman & Kwon aims to explore patterns of generic prescriptions among the statins in Korea, and to examine factors contributing to the market expansion after their patent expiration (July 2008) to provide future guidance. The authors found a substantial increase in the prescribing of generics in newly prescribed patients following their entry, a minor substitution effect among previously prescribed patients, and a major market expansion effect generated by the rapid increase in the number of new patients prescribed generics. The potential rationale behind this considerable increase is brilliantly discussed by the authors, despite the lack of laboratory data and reliable diagnosis information. The study is well-written and designed, and the discussion is consistent with the results.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Why does the title end with a question mark? I think it is a typo.

2. Lines 4-5, page 2: please explicit for the first time the abbreviation NHI (see also lines 17-18 and 21).

3. Line 4, page 4: please add a description of provider characteristics in Korea (i.e., tertiary general hospital, general hospital, hospital, clinics). It may be useful for a foreign reader.

4. Lines 7-8, page 3: please join the word "nature".

5. Line 27, page 3: please add "tertiary" at the end of the line, to avoid confusion between types of medical institutions.

6. Lines 30-33, page 3: this sentence sounds redundant. I suggest replacing "Unlike previously treated users [...]" with "To sum up, compared with previously treated users [...]".

7. Line 47, page 3: please add a parenthesis after "(see Figure (a)".
8. Lines 58-59, page 4: I would not use the word "influenced", as it implies causality. I suggest rephrasing the sentence as follows: "Demographic and socioeconomic status were not significantly associated with generic [...]".

9. Line 31, page 5: the sentence is badly written. I suggest rewriting as follows: "As mentioned, there is an increasing trend across countries [...]".

10. Table 1: please add "N(%)*" also after the subheading "Major comorbidities".

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

No

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal