Reviewer's report

**Title:** Teachable moments for smoking cessation counseling in a hospital emergency department: a mixed-methods study of patient-provider communication

**Version:** 3  
**Date:** 17 November 2014

**Reviewer:** Susan Flocke

**Reviewer's report:**

The authors have provided reasonable responses to most of the queries and have made a strong effort to revise the manuscript. The response to the point about the association of clinician experience and its association with providing a teachable moment should be removed from the discussion (starting on page 15 line 22). The authors are making comparisons and conclusions of an association based on 2 cases.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests