Reviewer’s report

Title: Predicting Risk of Hospital and Emergency Department Use for Community Based Elderly Persons through a Secondary Analysis of Cross-National Data

Version: 2
Date: 24 April 2014
Reviewer: Wen Kwang Lim

Reviewer’s report:

1) Was there Ethics committee approval for this study?
Under Analysis, reference was made to a literature review being conducted to define the working list of independent variables: how was this lit review conducted, what were the results, what are the references relevant to this review? It seems unusual that absence of Alzheimers was a predictive factor in reducing admissions. How were elder patients defined? What was the age cutoff?

The index seems complex with multiple predictive factors. How useful would it be clinically? Does it need to be further prospectively validated? Under clinical risk predictors such as ABCD2 for TIAs have simple scoring systems, easily used in practice. What would be the utility of this tool?

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'