Reviewer's report

Title: Assessing measures of comorbidity and functional status for risk adjustment to compare hospital performance for colorectal cancer surgery: a retrospective data-linkage study

Version: 5 Date: 20 April 2015

Reviewer: Niels Peek

Reviewer's report:

I am happy with the most of the revisions that have been carried out by the authors. There is one point that remains. The authors conclude that the Charlson comorbidity index can be computed for all patients using claims-based administrative data. This is trivially true because one simply assumes that the CCI is zero when nil comorbidities are described by these data for a given patient. The reality is that we do not know how good the coverage of the CCI in these data is, and thinking that the coverage is perfect because we can compute the CCI is delusionary. As noted before, this should be stated in the Conclusion of the paper. The current statement is misleading.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.