Author's response to reviews

Title: Assessing measures of comorbidity and functional status for risk adjustment to compare hospital performance for colorectal cancer surgery: a retrospective data-linkage study

Authors:

Timothy A Dobbins (timothy.dobbins@anu.edu.au)
Tim Badgery-Parker (tim.badgeryparker@sydney.edu.au)
David C Currow (david.currow@cancerinstitute.org.au)
Jane M Young (jane.young@sydney.edu.au)

Version: 6 Date: 5 June 2015

Author's response to reviews: see over
Dear Dr Taylor

MS: 2069420642145380
Assessing measures of comorbidity and functional status for risk adjustment to compare hospital performance for colorectal cancer surgery: a retrospective data-linkage study Timothy A Dobbins, Tim Badgery-Parker, David C Currow and Jane M Young

Thank you for your recent correspondence in which you asked us to make some additional minor amendments to our manuscript. Our point-by-point response follows:

Referee 2

Conclusion: requests modification of the statement that the Charlson comorbidity index can be computed for all patients using claims-based administrative data.

While we consider our statement that the Charlson comorbidity index can be computed for all patients is true, we agree that a zero score could be due to absence of comorbidity or absence of recorded comorbidity in the administrative health data collection. Only comorbidities that have a material impact on the admission of interest are coded in such datasets. The relevance for hospital risk-adjustment of comorbidities that do not affect patients’ hospital admission is unclear. However, in response to this reviewer’s comment we have now reworded the Conclusion sections of the Abstract and main text to remove the contentious sentence.

Editorial request

Delete the running title

This has been removed.

The changes have been track changed in the resubmitted manuscript. Please let me know if you would prefer a ‘clean’ copy at this stage.

Our revised article comprises an Abstract of 328 words, text 2919 words, 24 references and 4 tables.

Thank you for considering our revised manuscript.

Yours sincerely

Professor Jane Young
Professor in Cancer Epidemiology