Reviewer’s report

Title: A self-report of the Healer’s Art by junior doctors: Does the course have a lasting influence on personal experience of humanism, self-nurturing skills and medical counterculture?

Version: 1 Date: 02 Aug 2019

Reviewer: Robyn Woodward-Kron

Reviewer’s report:

Thank you for the revisions and responding to my comments (reviewer 1). Although the article is very well written, my major concerns remain about the strength of the contribution this manuscript can make to medical education: the dataset is very small and from a group of people who self-selected to do the course; the question about the influence of other factors in shaping the respondents' positive attitudes towards patients and how this can be distinguished from the healer's art course; and the fact that the short course was done several years prior to the study. The authors recommend that medical schools should audit their curricula (p. 22 line 50 onwards) to identify whether the humanistic values espoused in the HA are present. It is likely that they are present considering the focus this area has had in the past 10 years, but a more pressing question is why aren't they effective, and how can the impact of the hidden curriculum be counterbalanced. Is suggesting that students need to do this additional course undermining attempts of educators to address these issues inside the curriculum? I have read a similar paper on compassion training - also delivered alongside the curriculum, hence my reservations about the recommendations.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

No

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

Not relevant to this manuscript
Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal