Reviewer's report

**Title:** A model of professional identity formation in student doctors and dentists: A mixed method study

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 11 December 2014

**Reviewer:** Ian Wilson

**Reviewer's report:**

This is an interesting paper that extends the literature on the development of professional identity in medical students. There are a couple of areas that need explanation or expansion.

Firstly the is the methodological issue of selecting subjects because their PSIQ had changed by two scale points. The PSIQ scores need explanation so that the reader can determine the significance of a two point change.

Secondly I am concerned about the use of transference and countertransference. These terms have very specific meanings. For instance the definition of countertransference as "changing self perceptions to meet others expectations" underplays the profound psychological impact of countertransference in a therapeutic relationship. Different terminology needs to be developed.

I also have concerns about some of the discussion which seems to take the findings and extends them into areas further than the research would support. In particular I note the discussion about students who have not developed a sound PI at graduation. This is not the topic of the research. The authors' supposition that this is a negative is subject to debate. I believe that the PI continues to develop and refine as students progress to internship and then into specialty training. I would have concerns about a student who has fully developed his/her PI at the time of graduation.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

I declare that I have no competing interests