Title: Expression of a-Tocopherol-Associated protein (TAP) Is Associated With Clinical Outcome in Breast Cancer Patients

Version: 3 Date: 12 October 2015

Reviewer: Kevin Kalinsky

Reviewer's report:

The authors did an excellent job of responding to concerns and comments. Think the paper is clearer. Upon additional review, have further comments.

Major Compulsory

Results: Would include imitations comments, including small patient numbers (particularly for Oncotype analysis), lack of ki-67 and vascular invasion. And anything else the authors deem appropriate.

Table 1: Any statistical Analyses done to compare TAP negative vs. TAP positive for each variable? Would show in this table in a separate column.

Table 2: Same comment: Would show statistical analysis. This just numerically different?

Table 3: Would indicate which were significant. Perhaps, with an asterisks.

Table 4. Same comment. Would include statistical analysis. Right now, just descriptive.

Figures: I would change the horizontal units to be months. Is it currently days?

Minor Essential Revisions

Sentence 62. Would list as including breast cancer. However, clinical…

Sentence 79: Should read: Another study…

Sentence 97…Should read: In addition, in an independent cohort of 71 breast cases, we compared…

Sentence 103; Should read: collected from 1990 to 2001, was constructed.

Sentence 115: Assuming that all samples were HER2- also.

Sentence 126: additional spaces between words --- would just modify.


Sentence 156: Seems out of place at the bottom of that paragraph. Perhaps, would insert into the next paragraph.

Sentence 162. Should read chi square. TAP positive

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests