Author’s response to reviews

Title: Anti-inflammatory activities of astringent persimmons (Diospyros kaki Thunb.) stalks of various cultivar types based on the stages of maturity in the Gyeongnam province.

Authors:

Youngmin Kang (ymkang@kiom.re.kr)
Choi Jieun (dr98cju@naver.com)
Jung Haiyoung (haiyoung@kribb.re.kr)
Kim Mi jeong (tito006@kribb.re.kr)

Version: 3 Date: 08 Mar 2018

Author’s response to reviews:

List of changes for BMC CAM

----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Dear editor

We are very much thankful to you for giving us opportunity to revise our manuscript. According to the reviewers comments, authors responded accordingly to the points raised (Blue highlights in the manuscript is response to reviewer 1, red highlight is response to reviewer 2, green highlight shows responses to points raised by the editor and yellow highlights are vital additional information added by the authors that were originally not in the manuscript). All general and minor errors were fixed in accordance to the reviewer’s comment(s) and guidance. Additionally,
please check out the list of changes in manuscript and consider this manuscript for publication in BMC CAM.

Thank you.

-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Editor Comments:

Authors are required to give full justification for performing the anti-inflammatory studies. The statements ""Many phenolic compounds are known to be antioxidative, anti-inflammatory, anti-carcinogenic, anti-mutagenic, and cardioprotective" cannot justify the rationale behind the study.

Authors’ response: Dear editor, thank you very much for the unique guidance here. The whole introduction has now been thoroughly re-written to give a full justification and clarity for the anti-inflammatory activities of astringent persimmons (Diospyros kaki Thunb.) stalks of various cultivar types based on the stages of maturity in the Gyeongnam province.

The statements like "Taken together, extracts of persimmon stalk may be used as potent natural antiinflammatory agents in inflammatory diseases, including cancer, rheumatoid arthritis, and diabetes." in the discussion are beyond the findings reported in the manuscript. Authors should refrain from providing conclusion beyond the scope of the work performed. A more precise and clear discussion towards the findings and its possible implication would be more helpful.

Authors’ response: Thank you very much editor for pointing out this. We have re-written this section of the report focusing only on the findings of the study.

View Reviewer Comments for Manuscript

BCAM-D-17-01392R2

"Anti-inflammatory activities of astringent persimmons (Diospyros kaki Thunb.) stalks of various cultivar types based on the stages of maturity in the Gyeongnam province."

Mehmet Levent Altun (Reviewer 1)

Reviewer Recommendation Term: Accept without revision.

Authors’ response: Thank you for accepting our manuscript. We deeply appreciate.

A.H.M. Khurshid Alam, PhD (Reviewer 2)

Reviewer Recommendation Term: Accept after minor essential revisions
Comments to Author:

The author has described that the astringent persimmons has the highest tannic acid content as well as showed the highest anti-inflammatory activity in immature stage. However, the author needs to address the following queries before submit the revised manuscript.

1. In introduction section, the author repeatedly incorporated that the persimmons is used in the treatment of hiccups (page 3, line 74-83). Author should rewrite those sentences.

Authors’ response: Done as per the reviewer’s request. Sentences re-written.

2. In method section, ethanol was used as a solvent for extract the material, then dissolve the concentrated the ethanol extract with methanol, why. Author could extract the material with methanol directly.

Authors’ response: Thank you very much for pointing out this. We have paraphrased this section of the method to give it a clearer meaning. And also, since the 1st solvent (Ethanol) is evaporated out completely during the concentration process, we felt that the use of 2nd solvent (Methanol) to dissolve the extracted sample for analysis does not contradict the 1st process. Moreover, the materials were dried at 65 degree, which is very high temperature that can destroy the chemical constituents and could reduce their biological activities. Author should clarify these matter very carefully.

Authors’ response: This section of the method has been paraphrased to bring out a better meaning.

3. Author should check the manuscript by a native English speaker.

Authors’ response: Manuscript was checked thoroughly by the native English speaker.

4. Author should organize the manuscript according to journal instruction. Ex remove figure caption from page 9, line 233, 235 and so on.
Authors’ response: Thank you. Figure captions removed from the manuscript as per the journal instruction.