Reviewer’s report

Title: Water extract of Cnidii Rhizoma suppresses RANKL-induced osteoclastogenesis in RAW 264.7 cell by inhibiting NFATc1/c-Fos signaling and prevents ovariectomized bone loss in SD-rat

Version: 2 Date: 25 Oct 2018

Reviewer: Yuankun Zhai

Reviewer's report:

In current version, the author made some modification and improved the manuscript quality, but there still have some concerns need be addressed before it can be published. The main concerns are as follows:

(1) Please make a rearrangement of Figure 8, the HE staining of every sample need have a low magnification, and then use a high magnification to zoom in one area to show the trabecular bone, meanwhile, add the scale bar of every sample. So do the Trap staining.

(2) Because the author claimed that Cnidii Rhizoma mainly suppress the RANKL induced osteoclastogenesis by inhibiting NFATc1/c-Fos signaling, please add immunohistochemical staining figures by using femur sections, to show the where the location of RANKL, NFATc1, c-Fos, and whether they also changed in vivo.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Unable to assess

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

No
Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.
I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal