Author’s response to reviews

Title: Phytochemical investigation and nephroprotective potential of Sida cordata in rat

Authors:

NASEER SHAH (drnaseeralishah@gmail.com)
Muhamamd Khan (mrkhanqau@yahoo.com)
Dereje Nigussie (dere_nig@hotmail.com)

Version: 1 Date: 10 Apr 2017

Author’s response to reviews:

Dear Editor

BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine

I have revised the manuscript according the suggestions of reviewers and the text edited is mentioned in red color in attached manuscript. Point to point comments in response to reviewers is given below.

Reviewer reports:

Wissam Faour, Ph.D. (Reviewer 1): Dear Editor, the authors described the nephroprotective potential of Sida cordata in Rat. the study is well designed, however, i have some concern about the kidney disease model used in the study. while there are numerous and optimized acute and chronic kidney injury models, the authors use CCL4 model which is mostly used to induce liver injury and not kidney injury, also what type of injury is induced by CCl4 in kidney (is it sclerosis,nephritis,...), is it reversible or irreversible. the authors are required to comment on that and explain their choice in this regard.

To observe the changes in the antioxidative defense enzymes and to detect the alterations of renal microscopy after carbon tetrachloride (CCl4) administration in rats and to investigate the possible protective effects of desired extract. Several studies has been reported i.e.Bahcecioglu et al., 1999, Donder et al., 1999, Turkdogan et al., 2001 and Fadhel and Amran, 2002) which are using the same model of CCl4 for antioxidant defence system against kidney toxicity. Histologic alterations were observed in CCl4 treated rats. We detected Glomerular and tubular degeneration, interstitial fibrosis, interstitial mononuclear cell infiltration.
1) In table 5 the authors are recommended not to present kidney parameters separately, alternatively, they are requested to calculate Albumin-to-creatinin ratio which is more representative that urinary creat or albumin alone.

Followed

2) the authors need to include the variation in rat weight and kidney weight during the entire length of the study

Followed

3) the authors are recommended to show the effect of CCl4 on the liver (liver function or pathology), since liver has major impact on serum protein level

This data was not recorded but in future studies this recommendation will be followed.

Said moselhy (Reviewer 2): This manuscript reports on "Phytochemical investigation and nephroprotective potential of Sida cordata in Rat". Below are the comments:

Overall, the manuscript requires extensive English editing.

Done

Introduction: This section is too lengthy and paragraphing is awkward. Authors must rewrite the whole section and arrange the useful information accordingly.

Done

Materials and methods:
- Why CCl4 used as nephrotoxicity ?. It was used as hepatotoxicity

It is also used as nephrotoxicity agent especially for the experimental design involving free radical induced toxicity and antioxidant protective role.

- Specific parameters for renal function shoud be done as Osteopontin.

This data was not recorded but in future studies this recommendation will be followed.
Results: The histology results are not properly evaluated and presented.

Edited

Discussion: Discussion is too lengthy and is composed mainly of restatement of general information.

Edited

Conclusion: The current data and experiments do not support conclusion and title of the manuscript as the study is too preliminary.

No comment

Figures: Quality of Figures must be improve.

Followed