Reviewer’s report

Title: Effect of a herbal extract powder (YY-312) from Imperata cylindrica Beauvois, Citrus unshiu Markovich, and Evodia officinalis Dode on body fat mass in overweight adults: A 12-week, randomized, double-blind, placebo-controlled, parallel-group clinical trial

Version: 0 Date: 15 Apr 2017

Reviewer: Fang-Rong Chang

Reviewer’s report:

This MS is in a good shape. The authors brought comprehensive information about the YY-312 conducted through a clinical trial that focused on the body fat mass in overweight adults.

However, there are still some tiny concerns needed to be clarified as follows:

P7, L152

According to the ref [16], the dose of YY-312 administrated to C57BL/6 mice was 300 mg/kg. Please make a brief description for the design of dose (2.4g/day) taken by the participants. Or, how to convert the dose between these mice and human?

P7, L157-158:

Was the reduction of 500 kcal/day from participants' usual diet a usual physical situation? The instruction might be led to possible interference happened to the result between YY-312 administration and placebo groups.

Please make a brief explanation of the necessity for the reduction of calorie intake in the trial. Or, what's the strategy for?

P7, L152

According to the ref [16], the dose of YY-312 administrated to C57BL/6 mice was 300 mg/kg. Please make a brief description for the design of dose (2.4g/day) taken by the participants. Or, how to convert the dose between these mice and human?

P7, L157-158:

Was the reduction of 500 kcal/day from participants' usual diet a usual physical situation? It means that the participants reduce around 1/4 to 1/5 of their daily diet for 3 months. Please make a brief explanation of the necessity for the reduction of calorie intake in the trial. Or, what's the strategy for?

P8, L182:
Please elaborately and clearly indicate that how to evaluate the BFM and BF%.

P9, L218:

The placebo group showed a decrease of 1.0 kg in body weight as well. Comparing to the reduction of energy intake, please describe the advantage or necessity for the recommendation of YY-312 intake. Additionally, the possible influence of taking YY-312 on the "un-overweight or normal BMI" people should be briefly discussed as well, due to some incorrect concept of losing weight nowadays.

In view of the foregoing suggestions, this article could be accepted for publishing in the BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine after addressing the concerns listed above.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

No

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?
2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

'I declare that I have no competing interests'

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal