Reviewer’s report

Title: Immunomodulatory effects of preparations from Anthroposophical Medicine for parenteral use

Version: 1

Reviewer: Salvatore Chirumbolo

Reviewer’s report:

Major compulsory revisions

Reviewer’s comments

Major compulsory comments:

A) Although this is an apparently well written paper on anthroposophic medicine (AM) focusing on the bio-molecular effects of AM on immune cells, the biological item addressed the Discussion cannot be acceptable if tested solutions cannot be chemically characterized. This is because the Authors addresses the issue by taking into account the bio-molecular effect of defined chemical components without allowing the reader to realize how much component, in chemical terms, is present in the AM preparation. Therefore, this Reviewer cannot approve a Discussion on molecular terms while he cannot be aware of how much substance is present in the remedy. I will give some typical example of this bias:

1) “Colchicum reduced lymphocyte proliferation in a dose-dependent manner. As it is well known, that Colchicine inhibits mitosis and proliferation of immunocompetent cells [4– 6] and because Colchicine is present in the plant material (0.05-0.4% in Colchicum tuber) [11]"....this reasoning is not acceptable if colchicine cannot be measured....

In addition, certain speculative conclusions without further insights should be avoided. Example:

2) “Rosmarinus and Bryophyllum are the only parenteral preparations of AM which are available in the concentration of 5%. While Bryophyllum 5% does not affect the immune response, Rosmarinus 5% clearly inhibited proliferation of lymphocytes as well as maturation and functionality of DC. Because this effect is not mediated by apoptosis or necrosis, the parenteral rosemary preparation may indeed have a specific immunosuppressive effect”

B) The Authors should test also colchicine and rosmarinic acid

C) Methods must be specified better with specific and detailed description of methods, protocols, controls and performance carried on.

D) Did the Authors perform a normalization test (Kolmogorov-Smirnov or Shapiro-Wilk?)

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field
Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published.

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
None