Reviewer's report

Title: Time and Dose-Dependent Effects of Labisia pumila on the Bone Strength of Postmenopausal Osteoporosis Rat Model

Version: 1 Date: 30 June 2014

Reviewer: kainat khan

Reviewer's report:

Responses to the manuscript entitled by ‘Time and Dose-Dependent Effects of Labisia pumila on the Bone Strength of Postmenopausal Osteoporosis Rat Model’

The paper showed that LP could effectively reverse the bone loss in postmenopausal osteoporosis rat model. Authors gave evidence to show that LP, which has been reported earlier for having strong antioxidant, anti-inflammatory properties, could restore the biomechanical strength and correct the poor bone quality. It is a well-designed and explained study. This study for the first time shows that LP in a time and dose dependent manner could restore the bone strength in osteopenic rats. However, there are some serious concerns which the reviewer has and those must be addressed.

1. Although authors have implicated several possible mechanisms for the osteogenic effects of LP, but how about increased risk for incidence of endometrial hyperplasia, or excessive cell growth in the uterus, which is a secondary concern with the use of phytoestrogens for the treatment of postmenopausal osteoporosis? This could be tested by performing uterine histology in same experimental set up using similar doses of LP. The suggested experiment should be performed or the limitation should be addressed in a paragraph in the Discussion preceding your conclusion.

2. Authors had addressed many effects of LP, and try to give solid evidence to support LP can effectively restore bone loss of osteoporosis rats. But compared to these they have not cited even a single paper concerning the PK and bioavailability studies.

The suggested experiments should be performed or the limitation should be addressed in a paragraph in the discussion preceding your conclusion.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.
Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.