Reviewer's report

Title: Evaluation of antioxidant activity and cytotoxicity of extract and fractions of Nardostachys jatamansi DC in breast carcinoma

Version: 2  Date: 20 September 2014

Reviewer: Jean Paul DZOYEM

Reviewer's report:

The MS described the Evaluation of antioxidant activity and cytotoxicity of extract and fractions of Nardostachys jatamansi. Previous studies have been done on the antioxidant and cytotoxicity activity of roots extract of Nardostachys jatamansi (see references below), as result the originality of the present study remains on the fractions. Therefore results seem to be too small. However major improvements considering the concerns raised below might provide more merits to the paper to warrant a publication.

MAJOR REVISIONS

Introduction
- Authors should mention the below references as previous antioxidant and cytotoxicity work done on Nardostachys jatamansi roots extracts and draw the originality of their study compared to those previously published.
- “The plant is described in the traditional systems of medicine for its use as sedative, antidepressant, antiepileptic, antihysteric, hypotensive, antispasmodic, anti-inflammatory, and cardiotonic”. This statement need to be referenced.

Results
- What is the rationale behind the presentation of the percentage of inhibition when the IC50 values are also presented?
- Figure 4; what is the contribution of these graphs in the study? Four chromatograms presented that might serve as a quality control for future reference. This seems to be unnecessary.
- Table 2: (1) Please check for the significant difference between NJAQ and NJM since the SD for NJAQ is 0.94. (2) Please check for the meaning of NA as “Not active”, this might be ND for “Not determined”
- Table 3: The meaning of the letter “a” in the correlation between total phenolic content and ABTS scavenging activity should be checked. If this represents a statistical analysis, what about the other values in the table?

Discussion
In general the discussion is wordy. Authors should provide interpretation of the results obtained and discuss their relevance instead of unnecessary citation of published literature.
Published references on Nardostachys jatamansi


**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.