Reviewer's report

Title: The Trafficking of Women and Girls in Taiwan: Characteristics of Victims, Perpetrators, and Forms of Exploitation

Version: 1 Date: 04 Aug 2017

Reviewer: Anita Ravi

Reviewer's report:

This paper addresses an important issue in contributing to quantitative data and statistics regarding Human Trafficking.

However, there are several issues which need to be addressed prior to potential publication:

- if the ultimate goal of this study is to address that female trafficking victims were underestimated in the past, the results of this study don't address how the findings relatively compare to prior estimates.

- introduction: needs to be edited to include only the background information directly relevant to Taiwan and recent statistics- information regarding other countries can largely be moved, potentially incorporated into discussion section if applicable.

- pg 3- the term "underage prostitutes" is not in favor, as it is more accurately described as trafficked (rationale described here: http://rights4girls.org/campaign/#learnmore) - the term "underage aboriginal prostitutes" should be changed accordingly.

- methods: If the law was enacted in 2009, was it immediately implemented? Would it be more accurate to review cases from 2010 onward?

- results: contains information that belongs in either the intro or conclusion (the background/context presented before each case). Similarly, ideally the conclusion should not contain results that weren't previously discussed (ex: page 19- results on number of prosecuted traffickers needs to be moved to results section)

- throughout the paper, consistent terminology needs to be used- (eg. do not interchange the words female and woman, using "domestic" trafficking and "native" trafficking).
- there are elements of the conclusion that need to account for bias/limitation of study- the "Taiwanese cases show that cross-border trafficking in Taiwan is mostly conducted by Taiwanese men. No evidence shows that Taiwanese women act as..."- all conclusions need to be framed within the context that the data is based on criminal proceedings- those who were arrested for a crime, and charges were pursued- if women are engaged in trafficking, but less likely to be expected to be involved, this may also decrease their rate of arrest/court involvement, etc, so definitive information from this study describes who is being charged, but not necessarily reflecting the scope of trafficking that is occurring.

- if study is limited to women, remove inclusion of men in table 2 and limit entire table to women

- premise states that impetus for study is due to increasing numbers of female migrant workers in Taiwan- the term "migrant worker" needs to be incorporated and better defined with regard to Figure 1- where does it fit in to this flow chart?

**Are the methods appropriate and well described?**
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

**Does the work include the necessary controls?**
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

**Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?**
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

No

**Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?**
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics

**Quality of written English**
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Needs some language corrections before being published
**Declaration of competing interests**

Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

No

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal