Author’s response to reviews

Title: Disease severity, debridement approach and timing of drug modify outcomes of adjunctive Azithromycin in non-surgical management of chronic periodontitis: a multivariate meta-analysis

Authors:

Nithya Jagannathan (nityyaj@hku.hk)
Aneesha Acharya (aneesha.a2@gmail.com)
Ong Farn (yifarn1984@yahoo.com)
Kar Li (skyli@hku.hk)
Luigi Nibali (lnibali@qmul.ac.uk)
Georgios Pelekos (george74@hku.hk)

Version: 2 Date: 08 Feb 2019

Author’s response to reviews:

Response to reviewers:

The authors are thankful for the detailed review and have revised the draft in accordance with the suggestions as enumerated below. Changes in manuscript text are in red font for ease of review.

Reviewer reports:

Müge Lütfioglu (Reviewer 1): In general AGAIN I recommend to correct the abbreviations in the entire manuscript.

In the abstract the authors starts the abbreviations but those are changing in the main text.

The structures of abbreviations are confusing for example:

The author thank the reviewer 1 for the careful review and have revised the manuscript for consistency in abbreviations and spelling/capitalization.

nonsurgical periodontal therapy= S/SRP ???
Changed to scaling and root surface debridement (S/RSD).

Full-mouth=FMD D?,
Changed to Full-mouth debridement (FMD)/Partial-mouth debridement (PMD)]

probing depth=PPD extra P? or the authors should say probing pocket depth
Changed to probing pocket depth (PPD)

the author should make correct decisions about using correct letters about abbreviations.
Corrections are made in the abstract for consistency.

And ALSO:
Page 5 line 48...... Baseline ... b should be lower case
Correction is made as suggested

Page 5 line 55,60, ...... p-val.... In my opinion only saying " p= " would be enough. However the authors should make a decision about saying p-value or p-val or p= because they use al the forms of giving the value of p in the text.
Changed as suggested.

Page 6 line 1...... what is Q?
Q is changed to Q statistic.

Page 6 line 10...... Baseline ...... b should be lower case
Correction is made as suggested.
Page 7 line 5…… in the abstract the authors give the abbrev. As S/SRP= non surgical periodontal therapy but now saying scaling and root surface debridement= S/SRP
The term scaling and root surface debridement (S/RSD) is used consistently
Corrected.

Page 7 line 44…… the abbrev. problem about PPD= pocket dept?
probing pocket depth (PPD) is used
Corrected.

Page 8 line 54…… in the abstract the authors give the abbrev. As Full-mouth (FMD)/Partialmouth(PMD)], therapy but now saying full-mouth debridement (FMD) instead of the typical partial mouth/quadrant-wise regime (PMD)
Corrected throughout the draft.
the abbreviations are corrected to be consistent; full-mouth debridement (FMD) instead of the typical partial mouth debridement (PMD) regime such as a quadrant-wise approach
Page 9 line 44…… Baseline … b should be lower case
The correction is made.

Page 14 line 48…… adjunct to full mouth S/RSD and Quadrant wise S/RSD, with the control group having only S/RSD….. the authors did not used the abbreviation they have choosed about FMD or PMD.
Corrected for consistency and comprehension; Another trial compared the use of AZI and CHX mouth rinse each used as an adjunct to FMD type of S/RSD and to PMD type S/RSD performed quadrant-wise, with the control groups having only S/RSD [29].

Page 5 line 48……
Page 21 line 36,37...... azithromycin with scaling and root surface debridement ....the authors did not use the abbreviation they have chosen about those words

Corrected as suggested

Peter Bottenberg, PhD (Reviewer 2): In comparison with the previous version, the resubmitted version is much more to my liking. The authors have reacted to my suggestions and created a much more interesting text.

It is then only fair to accept this manuscript.

The authors thank the reviewer for the excellent suggestions which helped improve the quality of this work significantly and will also help in designing our future work.

Oum Keltoum Ennibi (Reviewer 3): The requested corrections are made but they must appear in the manuscript. It was necessary to submit a new version of the document including revisions.

The authors express gratitude to the reviewer for their valuable suggestions.

With Best Regards

Georgios Pelekos