Reviewer’s report

Title: The impact of collagen membranes on 3D gingival fibroblast toroids

Version: 0 Date: 10 Dec 2018

Reviewer: Yu-Tang Chin

Reviewer’s report:

This manuscript entitled "The impact of collagen membranes on 3D gingival fibroblast toroids" was submitted by Janjić et al. Authors tried to evaluate 3D gingival fibroblast toroids as a model structure for in vitro assay to examine the attachment of oral fibroblasts to collagen membranes. They found that the morphology of gingival fibroblasts was normal in this structure. But the morphology of gingival fibroblasts toroids on collagen membrane was showed dilatation. They demonstrated that these gingival fibroblasts toroids showed different attachment behavior. There are several issues need to be addressed:

1. Please clarify if the culture media/culture conditions used in toroid culture, spheroid culture, or monolayer culture were the same as in the culture of gingival fibroblasts isolation.

2. In the section of Hematoxylin-eosin staining, the last sentence "HE staining was performed." is redundant.

Are the methods appropriate and well described?
If not, please specify what is required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Does the work include the necessary controls?
If not, please specify which controls are required in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are the conclusions drawn adequately supported by the data shown?
If not, please explain in your comments to the authors.

Yes

Are you able to assess any statistics in the manuscript or would you recommend an additional statistical review?
If an additional statistical review is recommended, please specify what aspects require further assessment in your comments to the editors.

I am able to assess the statistics
Quality of written English
Please indicate the quality of language in the manuscript:

Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests
Please complete a declaration of competing interests, considering the following questions:

1. Have you in the past five years received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

2. Do you hold any stocks or shares in an organisation that may in any way gain or lose financially from the publication of this manuscript, either now or in the future?

3. Do you hold or are you currently applying for any patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

4. Have you received reimbursements, fees, funding, or salary from an organization that holds or has applied for patents relating to the content of the manuscript?

5. Do you have any other financial competing interests?

6. Do you have any non-financial competing interests in relation to this paper?

If you can answer no to all of the above, write 'I declare that I have no competing interests' below. If your reply is yes to any, please give details below.

I declare that I have no competing interests.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal. I understand that my name will be included on my report to the authors and, if the manuscript is accepted for publication, my named report including any attachments I upload will be posted on the website along with the authors' responses. I agree for my report to be made available under an Open Access Creative Commons CC-BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). I understand that any comments which I do not wish to be included in my named report can be included as confidential comments to the editors, which will not be published.

I agree to the open peer review policy of the journal